The static check needle in the warnings haystack

ELCE 2019
Lyon, France

Frank Rowand, Sony
Examples of Static Analysis Tools

- gcc
- dtc
- smatch
- sparse
What is the problem?
Premise

There many warnings reported by the static analysis tools against existing code.

It can be difficult to determine what new warnings a code change has created when so many warnings already exist.

Thus many developers and maintainers do not check for new warnings.
Premise

There are many warnings reported by the static analysis tools against existing code.

It can be difficult to determine what new warnings a code change has created.

Thus, many developers and maintainers do not check for new warnings.

True or False?
Look at an example

```bash
$ git checkout v5.4-rc3
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=3 drivers/of/overlay.o >/dev/null 2>&1
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=3 drivers/of/overlay.o 1>/dev/null 2>old_warnings

$ git checkout 5.4-rc3_test_v3
$ git log -n2 --oneline
  d85d7811732f of: drivers/of/overlay.c (v3) add new_func()
  4f5cafb5cb84 Linux 5.4-rc3
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=3 drivers/of/overlay.o >/dev/null 2>&1
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=3 drivers/of/overlay.o 1>/dev/null 2>new_warnings
```
(1) Many warnings?

```
$ wc -l old_warnings; wc -l new_warnings
1318 old_warnings
1320 new_warnings
```

Yes
(2) Hard to find new warnings?

$ wc -l old_warnings; wc -l new_warnings
1318 old_warnings
1320 new_warnings

$ diff -u old_warnings new_warnings | wc -l
127

Naive analysis suggests two new lines of warning messages

But diff of old vs new warnings show 127 lines differ
(2) Hard to find new warnings?

$ wc -l old_warnings; wc -l new_warnings
1324 old_warnings
1326 new_warnings

$ diff -u old_warnings new_warnings | wc -l
128

Yes
The problem commit

$ git diff 4f5cafb5cb84 d85d7811732f
diff --git a/drivers/of/overlay.c b/drivers/of/overlay.c
index c423e94baf0f..435f2272306a 100644
--- a/drivers/of/overlay.c
+++ b/drivers/of/overlay.c
@@ -23,6 +23,9 @@

#include "of_private.h"

+void new_func(phandle phandle) { } 
+EXPORT_SYMBOL(new_func);
+
+/**
+ * struct target - info about current target node as recursing through overlay
+ * @np: node where current level of overlay will be appl
(3) Don't check for new warnings?

Who in this room ever checks their submissions for new warnings?

What percentage of submissions?
Counter example

A different simple commit
$ git checkout resolver_new_warnings
$ git log -n2 --oneline
8a55f0697865 of: drivers/of/resolver.c new warnings for make W=1, W=2,
4f5cafb5cb84 Linux 5.4-rc3

$ rm drivers/of/resolver.o; make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o
   ... drivers/of/resolver.o
   CC      drivers/of/resolver.o

drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype
   for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func'
   [-Wmissing-prototypes]
New warning is obvious, right?

Many subsystems build with no errors for “make W=1”

Thus it is easy to see newly created warnings for W=1
New warning is obvious, right?

(build in source tree)

$ env | grep KBUILD_OUTPUT

$ rm drivers/of/resolver.o; \ 
   make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o
   ...  
   CC drivers/of/resolver.o
drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]
New warning is obvious, right?

(build external to source tree)

$ env | grep KBUILD_OUTPUT
KBUILD_OUTPUT=./build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc

$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/resolver.o; \
   make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o

...  drivers/of/resolver.o
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]
build internal vs. external

(build in source tree)

CC   drivers/of/resolver.o
drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]

(build external to source tree)

CC   drivers/of/resolver.o
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]
So what?

You are probably thinking:

If Frank is complaining about that, he isn't smart enough to be a kernel developer.

He probably isn't even smart enough to tie his own shoes.
So what?

There are many sources of noise that distract from being able to focus on the messages from the static analysis tools.

Some noise is minor
Some noise is major

But when all sources of noise add up, the result is that it can be hard to isolate new warnings.
Some solutions seem easy

original:

```
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/resolver.o;       \
>   make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o
make[1]: Entering directory `/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
    GEN    Makefile
    CALL   /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/checksyscalls.sh
    CALL   /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/atomic/check-atomics.sh
    CC     drivers/of/resolver.o
local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]
make[1]: Leaving directory `/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
```

remove noise:

```
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/resolver.o;       \
>   make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o 2>&1 1>/dev/null \n>   | sed "s|$|\get_CURDIR'/||g"
drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_ex_02_p_3_new_func' [-Wmissing-prototypes]
```
Some solutions seem easy

remove noise:

```bash
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/resolver.o;       \
>   make W=1 drivers/of/resolver.o 2>&1 1>/dev/null \ 
>       | sed "s|`get_CURDIR`/||g"
drivers/of/resolver.c:350:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'htsc_
```

Why `get_CURDIR` instead of `pwd`?

pwd usually works, but there are some corner cases where make $(CURDIR) != `pwd`

My get_CURDIR script invokes make to get $(CURDIR)
Examples of noise

Changing the value of “W=” can result in other files being rebuilt

Compiling those other files may generate warnings
Examples of noise - other files

$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=1 drivers/of/overlay.o
make[1]: Entering directory `/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
  GEN     Makefile
  YACC    scripts/genksyms/parse.tab.[ch]
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/genksyms/parse.y: warning: 9 shift/reduce conflicts [-Wconflicts-sr]
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/genksyms/parse.y: warning: 5 reduce/reduce conflicts [-Wconflicts-rr]
  HOSTCC  scripts/genksyms/parse.tab.o
  HOSTCC  scripts/genksyms/lex.lex.o
  HOSTCC  scripts/genksyms/parse.tab
  CC       scripts/genksyms/genksyms
  HOSTCC  scripts/mod/empty.o
  HOSTCC  scripts/mod/modpost.o
  CC       scripts/mod/devicetable-offsets.s
  HOSTCC  scripts/mod/file2alias.o
  HOSTCC  scripts/mod/sumversion.o
  HOSTCC  scripts/mod/modpost
  CC       kernel/bounds.s
  CC       arch/arm/kernel/asm-offsets.s
  CALL     /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/checksyscalls.sh
  CALL     /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/atomic/check-atomics.sh
  CC       drivers/of/overlay.o
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/drivers/of/overlay.c:26:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'new_func'
make[1]: Leaving directory '/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
$ rm ${KBUILD_OUTPUT}/drivers/of/overlay.o
$ make W=1 drivers/of/overlay.o
make[1]: Entering directory '/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
  GEN     Makefile
  CALL     /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/checksyscalls.sh
  CALL     /local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/scripts/atomic/check-atomics.sh
  CC       drivers/of/overlay.o
/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/linux--5.4-rc/drivers/of/overlay.c:26:6: warning: no previous prototype for 'new_func'
make[1]: Leaving directory '/local/frowand_nobackup/src/git_linus/build/dragon_linus_5.4-rc'
Examples of noise

gcc warnings include file line number

-drivers/of/overlay.c:776:2: warning: conversion to 'size_t' from 'int' may change the sign of the value
-drivers/of/overlay.c:835:2: warning: conversion to 'long unsigned int' from 'int' may change the sign of the value
+drivers/of/overlay.c:779:2: warning: conversion to 'size_t' from 'int' may change the sign of the value
+drivers/of/overlay.c:838:2: warning: conversion to 'long unsigned int' from 'int' may change the sign of the value
Examples of noise

gcc warnings include file line number

-line warnings:
-drivers/of/overlay.c:776:2: warning: conversion to 'size_t' from 'int' may change the sign of the result [-Wsign-conversion]
-drivers/of/overlay.c:835:2: warning: conversion to 'long unsigned int' from 'int' may change the sign of the result [-Wsign-conversion]
+line warnings:
+drivers/of/overlay.c:779:2: warning: conversion to 'size_t' from 'int' may change the sign of the result [-Wsign-conversion]
+drivers/of/overlay.c:838:2: warning: conversion to 'long unsigned int' from 'int' may change the sign of the result [-Wsign-conversion]

Line numbers can be filtered out before diff of old and new warnings

Resulting in another annoyance:

The warning message in the diff does not show the line number, so it is hard to find the offending line
Examples of noise

Some macro expansions incorporate line number

The incorporated line number may be visible in a warning message

-drivers/of/overlay.c:1139:2: warning: pointer of type 'void *' used in arithmetic [-Wpointer-arith]
-drivers/of/overlay.c:1139:1: note: previous declaration of '__compiletime_assert_1139' was here
-drivers/of/overlay.c:1139:2: warning: pointer of type 'void *' used in arithmetic [-Wpointer-arith]
+drivers/of/overlay.c:1142:2: warning: pointer of type 'void *' used in arithmetic [-Wpointer-arith]
+drivers/of/overlay.c:1142:1: warning: redundant redeclaration of '__compiletime_assert_1142' [-Wredundant-decls]
+drivers/of/overlay.c:1142:1: note: previous declaration of '__compiletime_assert_1142' was here
+drivers/of/overlay.c:1142:2: warning: pointer of type 'void *' used in arithmetic [-Wpointer-arith]
Solution: proof of concept tool

A set of scripts and programs, controlled by script “check_warn”
Revisit initial example

$ git diff 4f5cafb5cb84 d85d7811732f
diff --git a/drivers/of/overlay.c b/drivers/of/overlay.c
index c423e94baf0f..435f2272306a 100644
--- a/drivers/of/overlay.c
+++ b/drivers/of/overlay.c
@@ -23,6 +23,9 @@

#include "of_private.h"

+void new_func(phandle phandle) { }
+EXPORT_SYMBOL(new_func);
+/**
+ * struct target - info about current target node as recursing through overlay
+ * @np: node where current level of overlay will be appl
Revisit initial example

$ git checkout v5.4-rc3

$$ warn_check -v --rf2 -s drivers/of/overlay.c

$ git checkout 5.4-rc3_test_v3
warn_check - lines of warnings

==================== Number of lines in warning reports

=====  W=0
OLD:  0
NEW:  0

=====  W=1
OLD:  2
NEW:  3

=====  W=2
OLD:  606
NEW:  609

=====  W=3
OLD:  3295
NEW:  3297
**warn_check - warnings count**

=============  Count of each type of warning

=====  W=3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Warnings</th>
<th>Old</th>
<th>New</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-Wattributes</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wbad-function-cast</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wcast-qual</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wconversion</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wpacked</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wpadded</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wpointer-arith</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*-Wredundant-decls</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wsign-conversion</td>
<td>481</td>
<td>481</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Wswitch-default</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## warn_check - warnings count

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W=1</th>
<th>Old</th>
<th>New</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-Wconflicts-rr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-Wconflicts-sr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>* -Wmissing-prototypes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W=2</th>
<th>Old</th>
<th>New</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wcast-align</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wmissing-field-initializers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wnested-externs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td>* -Wshadow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wsign-compare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wunused-macros</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>W=3</th>
<th>Old</th>
<th>New</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wattributes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wbad-function-cast</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>141</td>
<td>141</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wcast-qual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>146</td>
<td>146</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wconversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wpacked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>277</td>
<td>277</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wpadded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
<td></td>
<td>-W-pointer-arith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>33</td>
<td></td>
<td>* -Wredundant-decls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>481</td>
<td>481</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wsign-conversion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>-Wswitch-default</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### filtered ###

@@ -3227,6 +3227,8 @@ filtered max 10
  drivers/of/of_private.h::5: note: previous declaration of '__of_attach_node_sysfs' was here
  drivers/of/of_private.h::13: warning: redundant redeclaration of '__of_detach_node_sysfs' [-Wredundant-decls]
  drivers/of/of_private.h::6: note: previous declaration of '__of_detach_node_sysfs' was here
+drivers/of/overlay.c::1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'new_func' [-Wredundant-decls]
+drivers/of/overlay.c::6: note: previous definition of 'new_func' was here
  drivers/of/overlay.c::1: warning: padding struct size to alignment boundary [-Wpadded]
  drivers/of/overlay.c::22: warning: padding struct to align 'cset' [-Wpadded]
  drivers/of/overlay.c::1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'of_overlay_notifier_register' [-Wredundant-decls]
<<<< old <<<<<
  drivers/of/of_private.h:66:5: note: previous declaration of '__of_attach_node_sysfs' was here
  drivers/of/of_private.h:67:6: note: previous declaration of '__of_detach_node_sysfs' was here
  drivers/of/overlay.c:44:1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'new_func' [-Wredundant-decls]
  drivers/of/overlay.c:75:22: warning: padding struct to align 'cset' [-Wpadded]
  drivers/of/overlay.c:140:1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'of_overlay_notifier_register' [-Wredundant-decls]
>>>> new >>>>>
  drivers/of/of_private.h:66:5: note: previous declaration of '__of_attach_node_sysfs' was here
  drivers/of/of_private.h:67:6: note: previous declaration of '__of_detach_node_sysfs' was here
  drivers/of/overlay.c:27:1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'new_func' [-Wredundant-decls]
  drivers/of/overlay.c:26:6: note: previous definition of 'new_func' was here
  drivers/of/overlay.c:47:1: warning: padding struct size to alignment boundary [-Wpadded]
  drivers/of/overlay.c:78:22: warning: padding struct to align 'cset' [-Wpadded]
  drivers/of/overlay.c:143:1: warning: redundant redeclaration of 'of_overlay_notifier_register' [-Wredundant-decls]
Where is warn_check?

Long term:

There is active discussion of whether to provide a location in the Linux kernel source tree for maintainer related tools

I would like to submit warn_check to that location
Where is it?

Short term:

    github

warn_check has some rough edges, but it is useful in it's current form

While it is not in the Linux kernel source tree, while I am making it suitable for submission, I will mirror it on github at:
    https://github.com/frowand/warn_check
Todo

Polish the code (smooth off the rough edges)

Supports .c, .s, .dts. Add support for:
  - sparse
  - smatch

Add multiple file support

Add option to specify commit_old, commit_new, check out the commits, optionally select all files in commit_old..commit_new

Submit to kernel.org
Call for help

I have found some of the causes of false detection of a new warning in a diff report through experience. I expect more such patterns to exist.

If you encounter other patterns please report them to me so that I can improve warn_check.
THE END

Thank you for your attention...
Questions?
How to get a copy of the slides

1) leave a business card with me
2) frank.rowand@sony.com
3) https://elinux.org/ELC_Presentations
4) http://events.linuxfoundation.org