Variety Hour
Making Sense of First Year Library Instruction
Introduction
Context

Regis University
- Liberal Arts, Jesuit University in Denver

RCC 200 (first-year writing course)
- 533 students.
- 32 class sections.
- 32 different topics, assignments, syllabi, and instructors.
- 8 instruction librarians.
Instruction

- Tours
- 1 & 2 session models
- Weekly short sessions
- Librarian and assignment creation
- One-shots, the only shot
Motivation

Assessment - Assessment-Assessment

- University
- Building
- Departmental
- Program

Buy-in and support from all of these levels.
Pilot Process
Project began

IRB approval

LiW proposal submitted

Student pre-instruction surveys administered (PollEverywhere)

Post-instruction survey sent to faculty

Post-instruction survey sent to students

Internal presentation to course director

Collected student papers

Paper rubric

Spreadsheet of doom

Google form of destiny

Data wrangling

Meeting when we realized this was actually two projects and that we couldn't really use our qualitative data
Surveys
How confident are you at using a library website to find resources for research?

- Respond at PollEv.com/regislibrary  
- Text REGISLIBRARY to 37607 once to join, then A, B, or C

A. Very confident – I’ve got this!

B. Confident – I could use some tips & tricks, but I could get started.

C. Not confident – I could use help getting started.

Total Results: 26
1. How confident are you at using a library website to find resources for research?
   A. Very confident – I’ve got this!
   B. Confident – I could use some tips & tricks, but I could get started.
   C. Not confident – I could use help getting started.

2. Where do you search for resources for research assignments?
   A. Search engine (Google, etc.)
   B. Library databases
   C. Wikipedia
   D. Books
   E. Magazines

3. If your first database search gave you 0 results, what would you do next?
   A. Change your search terms to be more broad
   B. Discuss changing your topic with your professor
   C. Change your search term to a synonym
   D. Change your search terms to be more specific

4. If you were writing an academic paper about current healthcare practices, which would be an appropriate resource to cite?
   A. A book, published in 1974
   B. A peer-reviewed journal article, published two years ago
   C. A magazine article, published last year
   D. A blog, published last week
   E. A newspaper, published today
Fall 2017 RCC 200 Student Follow Up Survey

Thanks for taking our survey! Don’t forget to click the link on the Thank You page after you submit to enter to win a drawing for one of three $25 VISA gift cards!

How confident are you at using a library website to find resources for research?

- Very confident – I’ve got this!
- Confident – I could use some tips & tricks, but I could get started.
- Not confident – I could use help getting started.
What tips or tricks did you learn in the library instruction session that have helped you in your school work?

Your answer

Is there anything that the librarians could do differently or better to help you learn about finding resources for research? Is there something you wish you had learned from a librarian that you didn't find out about in your session?

Your answer

Who was your RCC 200 teacher last semester?

Choose
Faculty Survey

- 13 responses (of 33)
- All open ended
- Sent by First Year Experience Director
Post-Instruction Faculty Survey

1. What was the most useful skill/information you think your students learned in this library instruction session?

2. What was the least useful skill/information you think your students learned in this library instruction session?

3. Are there any changes you could suggest that might have improved the library instruction session?

4. Are there things that still seem confusing about library research, either to you or to any of your students?

5. Have you noticed an improvement in your students' research papers (such as use of better sources) as a result of the library instruction?
Paper analysis
What we had:
- 58 de-identified student papers
- 489 citations from those papers

What we wanted:
- To assess the sources in those citations for “appropriateness”
# Paper Rubric

**Instructor name:**

**Class section:**

**Paper identifier:**

**Scorer:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Competency Level</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Exceeds - complete competency</td>
<td>This source <em>exceeds expectations</em> for the assignment and shows that the student <em>clearly understands</em> the research process, source selection, and the application of the source to the assignment/their argument.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Meets - considerable competency</td>
<td>This source <em>meets expectations</em> for the assignment and shows that the student <em>has a fair grasp</em> on the research process, source selection, and the application of the source to the assignment/their argument.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Almost - partial competency</td>
<td>This source <em>nearly meets expectations</em> for the assignment but shows that the student <em>may not fully understand</em> the research process, source selection, or the application of the source to the assignment or their argument.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Not at all - little competency</td>
<td>This source <em>does not meet expectations</em> for the assignment at all. The student does not seem to understand the research process, source selection, or the application of the source to the assignment or their argument.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
random philosophy blog

2 psychology today - poor - terrible

2 - what's the deal with "training goals"? whose goals?

2 - the conversation - website, but academic authors.

2 - beyond today'shello

2 - counselor's website.

2 - random holistic health website

4 - good general article

score: 2.5
Spreadsheet of Doom
Google Form of Destiny

(Resultant Data/Google Spreadsheet of Destiny)
Results
Limitations (out of our control)

- Surveys: self-reporting. Students are nice! Telling us what we want to hear?
- Papers: can’t really know why a student made any given choice.
- Don’t know student’s personal context, faculty/classroom context, etc.
Student confidence pre & post instruction

How confident are you at using a library website to find resources for research? N=181

- Very confident – I’ve got this! 13.8%
- Not confident – I could use help... 30.9%
- Confident – I could use some tips... 55.2%

How confident are you at using a library website to find resources for research? (N=104)

- Very confident – I’ve got this! 34.8%
- Not confident – I could use help getting started. 5.8%
- Confident – I could use some tips & tricks, but I could... 55.6%
Students want more
hands-on time, sessions, & follow-up

Teaching Faculty want more
Spring communication course instruction, multiple sessions, advance collaboration, & instruction on academic literature

Students need more
instruction around evaluation of resources
### Sources by Issues Type (N=172)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue Type</th>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Scholarly journal article</th>
<th>Non-scholarly periodical</th>
<th>News media</th>
<th>Government resource</th>
<th>Open web</th>
<th>Encyclopedia/reference</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timeliness</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garbage citation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unnecessary sources</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wat</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Book
- Scholarly journal article
- Non-scholarly periodical
- News media
- Government resource
- Open web
- Encyclopedia/reference
- Other
Timeliness & Relevance of scholarly journal articles

Credibility of open web resources

Citation issues varying degrees of success in-text & references
Project Takeaways
Challenges

▪ Quick timeline at the start
▪ Question wording
▪ Deidentification of data
▪ Staying focused on what we were measuring
▪ Defining “appropriate”
▪ Lindsay moved, then Meghan moved

Successes

▪ Buy-in from FYE faculty
▪ Getting papers from so many classes.
▪ Papers were so interesting!
▪ Opportunities for re-doing study next year
▪ Building researcher confidence & competence
Thanks!

- R&I department & other library instructors for administering questions & contacting faculty for papers
- Tom Riedel for support & vision
- Perri Moreno for data visualization
- Presentation template by SlidesCarnival
Any questions?

Lindsay
@ljbrownfield
brownfieldlj@unk.edu

Meghan
@jolakotturinn_
mdamour@loyola.edu

Courtney
@courtbrarian
cdrysdale@regis.edu

Slides available at goo.gl/9tBUCn
Post-Instruction Extra Student Questions

5. Which of the following examples may yield the best database search results for the following statement? “Describe the effects of warm water to the strength of a hurricane.”
   
   A. Effects AND hurricane
   B. Hurricane AND “warm water” AND effects
   C. Effects AND warm AND water AND weather
   D. Effects of warm water to the strength of a hurricane

6. What tips or tricks did you learn in the library instruction session that have helped you in your school work? (open ended)

7. Is there anything that the librarians could do differently or better to help you learn about finding resources for research? Is there something you wish you had learned from a librarian that you didn’t find out about in your session? (open ended)

8. Who was your RCC 200 instructor?
   (drop down with all instructors)
What tips or tricks did you learn? (73)

Databases (38)
“Learning which database to use for different research topics”

Search Strategy (24)
“Sometimes it’s better to start broad and not narrow down too much at the beginning of research”

ILL (9)
“That we can get articles loaned to us from other libraries”

Website (7)
“Go online for sources from Regis’s website”

Peer-review (4)
“How to find only peer reviewed articles and how to access the research guides for different classes.”

How to get help (1)
“If you get stuck as a library is a great resource to use especially the online chat”
What can we do better? (69)

Nothing (45)

“No. I really learned a lot from my session and it greatly helped me with my research.”
What can we do better? (69)

Multiple sessions
“I think there should be more than one session. All the info in one class led me to forget some of it.”

Hands-on
“A hands-on walkthrough instead of just a presentation. Allowing students to engage in the research process as well.”

Follow Up
“Sending us directions after the session. I forgot how to get to some website after the meeting.”
It would be nice to have a librarian come talk to one of my classes to tell us about all the resources.
Selected suggestions from Faculty

Multiple sessions
“Having multiple, short sessions really helped integrate research habits into the course.”

Flipped classroom
“...I felt like there were some basic things that I would like to use a ‘flipped classroom’ model for next time...”

Advance prep
“If I prepare more in advance, it would be useful to have students bring with them their research ideas so that the librarians can use their examples.”

Academic lit
“Please spend a bit more time on discerning what is academic literature.”

C-courses
“...I do think they need continued instruction into second semester with the C-courses.”

More advanced
“The overview provided was essential, but I could do the same thing in 20 minutes or less... They were all hungry to learn more...”
Issues in papers

Source Issues vs. No Issues (N=489)

1+ issues
28.0%

137

352

no issues
72.0%
Issues in papers

### Issues in Papers

- **at least 50% of sources had 1+ issues**: 12
- **between 0 & 50% of sources had 1+ issues**: 36
- **0 sources had issues**: 10