Uncovering the Mystery of Argument

presented by
Angelita Jordan
Kanelia Cannon
New Ellenton Middle STEAM Magnet School
What is C.E.R.?

• Claim
  Answers the question

• Evidence
  Facts, observations, and data
  At least three pieces
  Specific and relevant

• Reasoning
  Explain why the evidence supports your claim

When can students use it?

• Defending a position
• Answering a Question
• Comparing opposing viewpoints of an event
  • Wars
  • Global Warming
  • Diets
  • Body Systems
• Conducting an experiment/investigation and collecting data
• Discussing the difference between observation and inference
“Slip or Trip”

After Margaret and her husband Charles got into a fight, she stormed out of the house and left him at home alone. Margaret drove to her country club where a party was going on. Everyone there complimented Margaret on her dress and how well it fit her slender figure, and this made her feel a little better.

Margaret left just before one in the morning and invited a few friends to follow her home for one more drink. She got home ten minutes before they arrived, but when her friends rang the doorbell, Margaret ran outside, saying, "Something terrible happened! Charles slipped and fell on the stairs. He was coming down for another drink--he still had the glass in his hand--and I think he's dead. Oh my God, what should I do?"

The police concluded that Charles died from a wound on the head and confirmed the fact that he'd been drunk. What do you think happened?

You are a member of the investigative team. You must determine whether this was an accident or a murder. Highlight the evidence in Margaret’s story and the picture and look for clues for how and why the incident occurred. Once you've gathered the evidence, make your claim. Was it an accident or murder?
CLAIM: Margaret is (innocent/guilty) of murdering her husband Charles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lip Order?</th>
<th>EVIDENCE</th>
<th>EXPLANATIONS (including context of evidence, interpretation of evidence with warrants as needed, and SO WHAT’s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>They got into a fight.</td>
<td>This gives the wife a motive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

REASONS (What do you need to prove to make your claim "true?")
“Slip or Trip?”
At five-feet-six and a hundred and ten pounds, Queenie Volupides was a sight to behold and to clasp. When she tore out of the house after a tiff with her husband, Arthur, she went to the country club where there was a party going on. She left the club shortly before one in the morning and invited a few friends to follow her home and continue to talk. They got to the Volupides house about ten minutes after Queenie, who met them at the door and said, “Something terrible happened. Arthur slipped and fell on the stairs. He was coming down for a drink of milk—he still had the glass in his hand—and I think he’s dead. Oh, my God—what shall I do? The autopsy conducted later concluded that Arthur had died from a wound on the head.
Claims – Evidence – Reasoning (C-E-R) Writing Graphic Organizer

Remember: The purpose of this Graphic Organizer is to help make connections between the claim, the evidence of that claim, and the reason that the evidence supports that claim. The order that you use it doesn’t matter (questions first, claim first, evidence first, or reason first).

Question

Claim

Evidence
Transition Words
Source
Reason:

Evidence
Transition Words
Source
Reason:

Evidence
Transition Words
Source
Reason:

Conclusion
Transition Words
Slip or Trip?
Your group is an investigative team that must determine what may have happened. You can either agree or disagree with Queenie’s version.

1. Do you think Queenie is telling the truth? (Claim)
2. Find all the evidence you can that indicates whether or not Queenie is telling the truth. Make a list of all the evidence. Evidence includes concrete, observable information; personal testimony; written documents; and material objects and their condition or appearance. (Evidence)
3. Next explain how each piece of evidence supports your claim that Queenie is or is not telling the truth. (Reasoning)
4. You should complete your C.E.R. graphic organizer before you write your final report.
5. Write a report to convince the others in the class that your analysis makes the most sense.
What's a Counter Argument?
It is when you recognize the other side of the ARGUMENT in order to strengthen your own argument. In other words, it’s the thesis making the OPPOSITE (aka: counter) point.

What's a Refutation?
Refute means to prove wrong. Refutations—saying why the counter argument is wrong (or not as right as your claim).

SENTENCE STARTERS

Use the following phrases to help you get started writing counter arguments and refutations...

Standard Format

Some people may say that (my thesis) is not true because... However, this is wrong because...

Counter Argument Sentence Starters...
✓ Some will say that (my claim) is not true because...
✓ Some people might say that...
✓ Some will argue...
✓ Those on the other side of the issue may say that.
✓ It’s true that...
✓ While it is true that...
✓ Admittedly...

Refutation Sentence Starters...
✓ That is not the case. As we see (bring up new evidence)...
✓ While that may be the case, (my thesis) is still true because...
✓ That point is true, but it is unimportant because...
✓ Nevertheless, my point still stands because...
✓ However, that point is not important because...
✓ Transition words: but, yet, however, nevertheless, still
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MY ARGUMENT &amp; ONE OR MORE SUPPORTS (WHY?)</th>
<th>THREE PARTS OF EFFECTIVE COUNTERARGUMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>MY SIDE</strong></td>
<td><strong>OTHER SIDE:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHY? (supporting detail/fact):</td>
<td><strong>SUPPORT FOR WHY OTHERS THINK THIS WAY:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>REFUTING THE COUNTERARGUMENT (WHY THEY ARE WRONG?)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Just a whiff
- A sniff
- A full smell
Contact Information

- Angelita Jordan, AJordan2@acpsd.net
- Kanelia Cannon, KCannon@acpsd.net
- Phone: (803)652-8200- NEMS Main Office

Notes