
ICANN81 | AGM – Get to Know ICANN Community: Noncommercial Stakeholder Group
Sunday, November 10, 2024 – 15:00 to 16:00 TRT

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Hello, everyone. Welcome back to get to know ICANN community onboarding session for newcomers. Today in the morning we heard from the Commercial Stakeholder Group. And now it's time for us to learn about the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group within ICANN. My name is Siranush Vardanyan and I am a participation manager for this session.

Please note that this session is being recorded and governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior and ICANN Community Anti-Harassment Policy. During this session questions and comments will only be read aloud if submitted in the chat in a proper form as I have noted in the chat space. Interpretation for this session include six UN languages and Turkish.

If you would like to speak during this session, please raise your hand in Zoom. When called upon, virtual participants will be given permission to unmute in Zoom. On-site participants will use a physical microphone to speak. Please state your name for the record and language you will speak if speaking a language other than English. And speak at a reasonable pace to allow accurate interpretation. With that, it's my pleasure to introduce the speakers for this session.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

The chair for the GNSO Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group which we usually call NCSG. Then the representative of NPOC which is the Not-for-Profit Operations Constituency. Organizations constituency. They keep changing it. So, Juan, the chair of NPOC and NCUC which is the Non-Commercial Users Constituency. Benjamin is here. And without further ado, I will give the floor to chair of NCSG. Julf, the floor is yours.

JULF HELSINGIUS:

Thank you, Siranush. And welcome everybody on behalf of the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. My name is Julf Helsingius. And if you wonder about my slightly strange accent, I'm actually representing a very small cultural minority, the Swedish-speaking Finns. As in coming from a Swedish-speaking minority in a country that already doesn't have very many people. Some other Swedish-speaking Finns that you might have heard of is the incoming CEO of ICANN, Curtis Lindquist. And Linus Torvalds, who wrote Linux.

So, I represent the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. And we see ourselves as the voice of civil society, especially in the GNSO, but in the whole ICANN ecosystem. So, we are part of the GNSO, the Generic Name Supporting Organization, which is the policy-making body responsible for the generic top-level domains, .COM, .NET, all those.

The GNSO council consists of two houses. The Contracted Party's House, Registrars and Registries, and the Non-Contracted Party's House, which have two stakeholder groups, the Commercial Stakeholder Group and the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. So, we represent the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. And under that,

we have two sub-constituencies, which will be presented soon. So yes, as I said, two houses and the two constituencies.

So, on the top-level NCSG stakeholder group, we can have direct members, who are directly members of the stakeholder group, not the sub-constituencies. They can be individuals, they can be organizations. But mainly our membership is through one of the two constituencies, either as non-commercial users or as Not-for-Profit organizations.

So, one important thing about us is that our membership is very diverse, both culturally and geographically, and in terms of background. We are all over the world, we have significant representation from pretty much everywhere. And our membership consists of NGOs, academics, and actually a surprising amount of technical community as well. We have a very long list of potential members, people who have joined us at some point. But every year, when we have our elections, we do a check-in email, where you're only allowed to vote if you actually respond to the mail, so we know who is still active.

And according to that, we now have, the latest count was 314 active members, who actually participate and vote. Most important thing is, of course, what are we about? So our values and priorities are the open global Internet, advancing human rights, protecting access to knowledge, because there's a lot of people who want to restrict that, privacy, freedom of speech, and openness and transparency. Things I'm sure we can all agree on, but some feel more strongly about it than others, and we tend to feel rather strongly about this.

So we have six representatives on the GNSO council. We have an executive committee that consists of two members per our sub-constituencies, plus the chair. And we have a policy committee, who then actually really make the policy decisions, and assign people to working groups, and so on. Where again, the sub-constituencies are represented, our council members are represented, and of course, the chair is present as well. So that's my part, so I'm now handing over to our sub-constituencies. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: What we have decided, we'll have three presenters to say the introductory word, and then we'll give the opportunity for questions and answers. One, can we have the second slide up, please, for NPOC? Thank you.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Hello, everyone. While the presentation is loading, I may introduce me. Okay. My name is Juan Manuel Rojas. I am the chair of NPOC. It stands for Not-for-Profit Organizations Constituency. And I'm from Colombia, Latin America. And so, I will try to explain in a few words, what do we do here. So, let's take it.

So, NPOC, it's a constituency where the Not-for-Profit Organizations can gather. Our idea is to provide voice on Internet governance for organizations that are Not-for-Profit and non-governmental organizations. As Joe says, we are part of NCSG, of course, and we are inside of GNSO itself. It's a part of the map when you can locate where

we are in the green circle. It's GNSO. We are there, like a Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group and Not-for-Profit. If you watch an old picture, maybe it says operational concerns. But now, since July, it was approved, our new charter that starts this time to his new term. And with this term, we change our name. So, since July, since last year, we are known as Not-for-Profit Organizations Constituency.

In this case, we are-- this is an old graphic. But because it was like the organization, it was concerned about the operational issues. But it was always a little bit tricky to identify what are the operational concerns. But it's regarded, it's about domain name system. So, this is the mission. Okay, it's just a short one. We are focused on some topics as DNS abuse, transparent domain registration, privacy, domain name fraud, cybersecurity, and intellectual property abuse affecting any organization that could be a Not-for-Profit Organization. And maybe your name was registered, and it belonged to another one, and you can try to know what you can do. It's the kind of things that we are worried.

And also, inside the GNSO, we are also looking for how that policies are affecting the organization that we represent. We are more than 110 actual members active from every part of the world. So, we have members from-- we are not geographically separated. We are all around the world. We accept any organization from around the world. So, it's the topics. This is a kind of explain a little bit from each one, but I don't deepen that in order to have enough time to your questions.

This is privacy, transparent domain, intellectual property, the topics. And this is what we have achieved. And this is what the invitation is,

how you can participate in NPOC. You should be an organization. It should be registered in your country. And you should be the owner of a domain. And you can apply to be a member of NPOC. But the good thing is that you can be a member of three of us. You can be a member from NPOC. You can be a member from NCUC. And you can be a member from NCSG. All at the same time. Just one application, you can be part of three of us.

I think that's it for me. This is the information when you can find the membership application. And that's it. That's it for me, I think. Thank you.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Can you guys see me? No, good afternoon. Can you see my face? Can you see my eyes?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Benjamin, I'm sorry. Can we have the next slide uploaded? Yes, thank you. And let me introduce the person who came from the fellowship program, actually. And you can, like, judge. He loves to speak. But it's my immense pleasure to introduce Benjamin, who is now within NCUC. He's an active community member. And he's very passionate about what he does. And Benjamin, go ahead. The floor is yours.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you so much. Thank you for the privilege. Congratulations to you fellows. I can't see my face.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: And just to make sure, we don't have only fellows in this group. We do have Fellows, Next-Geners, and the newcomers for whom this is the first ICANN meeting. So, we invited all of them. So, don't focus only on Fellows.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you. Next-Gens, everybody, you're all welcome. I'm excited to see you. And the best place to be where excitement lives is NCUC. So, Non-Commercial User Constituency. So, I'm excited to welcome you here. And as part of the family, NCUC, we advocate for the voice of the civil society. We're very passionate around things that has to do with non-commercial users, that has to do with the DNS system. So, we look for interest that talks about privacy, human rights, freedom of expression.

If any of this resonates with you, NCUC has a platform for you to air your voice, opinion, and interact, and get to understand the conversation. So, our mission, essentially, is to ensure that the voice of non-commercial users of the domain name system get heard. So, that's what we do.

So, our representation is also global. So, if you come to our community, there's a chance for you to represent your region and to advocate for the voice of the non-commercial. So, we provide that platform for everyone that is interested in those issues. And the way we engage most of the time is on our mailing list and opportunity to convert. So,

what we do is that we mobilize. We identify the issues. We mobilize representatives to the various ICANN meetings and ensure that in the conversations, non-commercial users' voices are heard. The opinions are put out there. Sometimes, we might be a bit aggressive about it, but that's the power we have. That's the only thing we have, our voice, to air it and say, hey, listen to this part of it, look at this other aspect of it, rather than just focusing on commercial or economic values of some of these things.

So, our membership strength, as out of the last check, we're almost 200. And just like Juan and Julf said, you can be any member of the groups. But one thing I must tell you about NCUC, we have the history. We were from the beginning. We've been here. We are consistent.

So, as I've said to you, we also, the engagement, the active engagement is in NCUC. But the policy conversation development is at NCSG level, at the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. But the community engagement, the discussion, where the representatives are selected, the ground zero, it's with NCUC when it comes to non-commercial users' voice, issues around privacy, issues around human rights. So, we have those conversations, and we send representatives to NCSG, and then our representatives also go from there to the council. So, that's where we debate the conversations.

And we also organize outreaches, and we organize capacity-building endeavors. So, one thing you can learn from us is building your capacity, the learning, because we're also made up of groups like academics, activists, lawyers, all of those groups that are with our

community. So, I would encourage you to join in. And policies is one of our strong points, too. That's where you know the policy conversations or stand we take. And some of the members are also here. You'll see them shortly.

So, in the whole scheme of things, when you look at the whole multistakeholder arrangement, how many of you have been hearing multistakeholder since you came here? So, this is what it represents. That's it right there. And the red dots, where we have the green bubble, and that red drawing that I made there, that is where we stand in the whole scheme of things. We're tiny, but that's where we stand there, so in case you're looking for where to find us. So, that's where we play. We're in the GNSO, Generic Name Supporting Organization.

So, these are topics that are of interest to us at the moment. If you were there earlier today, you heard about the DNS abuse mitigation with the CPH, that's Contracted Party House. It was also a capacity building session. If you were in the room, the issue around DNS, how to avoid DNS abuse, you saw how it was done. It was community-based. People were really given the practical opportunity to encounter registrars that take actions on things they feel like is DNS abuse.

So, new gTLD SubPro is on right now. It's also something that we work assiduously with to ensure that those who didn't benefit extensively at the last SubPro were given better opportunity now. So, Registration Data Request Service, RDRS, which is replacing WHOIS, that's a matter of privacy. We have also been very active in that space. So, these are all the issues, and if any of these issues relate with you, please come

with us and let's continue to discuss it. We need new minds around these issues.

So, here are the leaders. If you look around the room, you can find some of them here. Pedro is here. I can see Pedro. Okay, and that's Ken. So, feel free to engage with these individuals. They are very friendly individuals, and they are eager to tell you a lot more, not just about NCUC, about any section of the community, and they'll be very helpful. I can guarantee that. If not, you can withdraw your money from me. So, thank you very much. That is us. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, Benjamin. Thank you for the presentation, and thank you all for presenting. Before we start the questions, can you tell us where and when you are holding your sessions, where it might be important for newcomers come and listen to you and what you discuss and what is the procedure for that?

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Okay, so these are also easy ways you can find us, but tomorrow we have a meeting that is not on the calendar. It's an outreach session, so if you are here in Istanbul and you're a civil society organization that wants to know more about us, that session is for you. We don't have an agenda, but just to listen to you, to find out issues that are of interest. We have a little introduction of NCUC, but the most part of that session will be listening to your activities that might align with us. So that's for NCUC. On Tuesday, we have two sessions.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Tomorrow at what time, Benjamin?

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: It's 3 p.m. Andrea has to help me. I'm mixing my time up at home on here. 3 p.m. local time to 4 p.m. 3b60. So it's a beautiful session. Issue forum is on Tuesday. Issue forum is not tomorrow. Issue forum is on Tuesday, and our membership meeting is also on Tuesday. Those sessions are capacity building sessions. They're going to tell you a lot about our participation, our policy conversations, and some of the progresses we've made. So Tuesday, we have issue forum, which is solely also hands-on sessions. You will see demonstration in issue forum. A membership meeting gives you an opportunity to join us and hear your concerns, and you can also tell you how to join. We can even do that on the spot.

Whereas tomorrow outreach is just to get to know the local community in this region and see how we can collaborate and synergize to move our causes forward. So those are the two activities, two days that you see us actively participating in this AGM. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Julf?

JULF HELSINGIUS: NCSG, we unfortunately already had yesterday our policy session, and we're actually having our membership session right after this at 4.30.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: We have already our membership session that is open, but it was yesterday also in the afternoon, so it was a good session. We discussed yesterday about digital policy and privacy issues, but it was yesterday at 4.30 in the afternoon.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: But the good thing is that these people now, so you always can talk to them and find out what you are interested in more. But let's go to the questions. Mayssam, I see your hand raised, and Emmanuel, thank you for helping with the mic. No, we start with the lady, and then Abdulrahman will come to you. No, you, you.

MAYSSAM SABRA: Thank you. So my question is related to NCUC. Thank you for the presentation. And I understood that you are guys as a platform or hub to listen, to share ideas, to brainstorm, maybe, which is very good. But I'm curious to know how do you transform or how do you concretize these ideas into actions? Are there any-- how do you do it? Or there are, in other words, how these ideas or how our voice could be transformed to an initiative, if you want, a concrete initiative or concrete action.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: So whenever you hear from everyone or you engage on the discussions, how then you process this, how you put in action what whatever you discuss, and how you process these discussions into this global level.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you very much. I didn't get your name.

MAYSSAM SABRA: My name is Maison. I'm a newcomer. I'm a fellow. First time.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Okay. Thank you. So remember I told you that at the Non-Commercial User Constituency, we do a lot of advocacy. So say, for example, you have an issue of concern and you bring it to the mailing list and you're able to mobilize people around it. One of the things we do is we keep building momentum around this conversation. So how that comes to is that if the issue becomes a critical issue within ICANN-- so ICANN most of the time puts out issues of contention in terms of public comments and things like that. And then we look at those issues and say, this is where we stand. So some of the way we make our issues concretized is to make sure we influence the policy that finally comes out.

So if a policy, one of such action is the WHOIS database. It used to be a public, anybody could go to it. And we've been advocating that we didn't want that to be publicly available because of privacy concerns. And we continue agitating, not just us with other community members in the multi-stakeholder process. And until a change happened, I mean, coincidentally with GDPR. But you see, that's a practical step.

Another thing is, today, the CPH conversation. We've been discussing DNS abuse concerns and the way it's been addressed. And you can see

that today we had a meeting, a session that we called The Contracted Party House together with us. And we had a session. So we're getting some form of consensus. By the time we achieve that, we have common understanding in the policy discussion or policy, our influence would show in that way. So it's a lot about advocacy, education, and pushing our agenda and seeing. Sometimes we also release statements to say this is where we stand. Does that answer your question? Yes. Okay. Thank you.

JULF HELSINGIUS:

Thank you. I would like to clarify some things. Of course, the main vehicle we have for actually making change and actually making a difference and having an action is through the GNSO processes where we participate through the GNSO council. That's our major vehicle. And that's how things through the proper processes, we actually get the end result we hopefully want. So it's through our council representation, which is primarily through, of course, our councilors, which are not specific to any of the constituencies here. We have our common NCSG councilors.

They, of course, get their input from our very active mailing list, which, because we believe in openness and transparency, is open to any of you to read and join and participate in. But things don't happen in the council just by some of the councilors deciding it. There are working groups and that's part of the process. And in the working groups, we have councilors participating, but also just members who are interested

in that specific topic. So that's the real physical way of actually affecting things.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Yeah, thank you. Thank you, Julf. I just want to add a real example that happened to us just a little bit. It was like, I don't remember how many times, but it was recently. We are doing a following in the policy discussions in each topic. We have people focus on each policy. And one practical example could be that one of our members should note that, okay, we did a comment as NCSG and the working group wasn't including our comment in their discussions. That's a practical thing that we noted. And, okay, this comment, our comment is not having into account into discussion.

So it was a practical thing that we note because we did a comment, a public comment, and we were not heard that. So I think that was just a bit example that how we are making or making sure that we are being heard in this policy discussion. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yes, Abdulrahman.

ABDULRAHMAN ABOTALEB: Okay. Thank you. My name is Abdulrahman Abotaleb from ISOC Yemen, and I am an ICANN81 fellow. I'm also a journalist, so I'm very interested about NCUC. My question is, given the diverse range of non-commercial interests, how does the NCUC ensure that the voices of

smaller nonprofits are, let's see, adequately or fairly represented within ICANN? And could you share with us some recent examples where the NCUC successfully influenced the policy of ICANN to protect or even to advance the non-commercial interests? Thank you.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you. I didn't get your name as well.

ABDULRAHMAN ABOTALEB: Abdulrahman Abotaleb.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Abdulrahman Abotaleb.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you, Abdullah. So this is an exciting question. You see, during this applicant guidebook for SubPro, the subsequent procedure, this call for the new gTLD program that is going to come out. We know that in the last one, small NGOs that applied didn't succeed, and we felt they were going to lose out again in this one for new gTLDs. So we know we advocated a lot to make sure that there was proper support for new in this program so that it reaches those who were underserved in the last time.

Most of the things we have in the SubPro in terms of applicant guidebook, support, and all of that, those were a lot of, I won't take all the praise, but we did a lot of advocacy. Someone like Cathy advocating

that we must ensure that the underserved communities are properly empowered, communicated, guided to make sure they succeed in this new program that is going to start, that is starting already. So that's something that we did to ensure that small NGOs or small communities that lost out in subsequent in the previous ones don't lose out in this. I don't know if this answers your question, but that was a lot of advocacies by us. Yeah.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN Thank you. Thank you. Rukaiya, you're the next. Rukaiya, you wanted to? No? Okay, then Busayo.

OLUBUSAYO MARY BALOGUN: Thank you so much, Benjamin. My name is Busayo Balogun from Nigeria, ICANN81 fellow, and I must confess, based on your presentation, the NCUC seems like a fun place, active place to be in. I'm almost convinced to be there. But quick question, Benjamin, is there a membership fee to become a member, or is it just open to us? Is it just by joining the mailing list and advocating for issues that are passionate to the not-for-profit, the non-commercial, or do we have to pay a fee to join the good and great work that you're doing over there? Thank you so much.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you, Busayo. Yes, you are correct. It's the fun place to be. Well, I'll also let Julf give a back-end answer to this. For NCUC, there is no fees. But there is no fees for NCUC, that I'm sure about. But our

membership is, you join our community from NCSG, and it's for particular operational reasons. So, Julf, speak to that right now.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS There is no fee for no one.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Julf, please.

JULF HELSINGIUS: Thank you, Benjamin. Yes. The way you actually join is, there is an application web page where you can, when you apply for membership, you can decide whether you want to join just NCSG or one or both of the constituencies. Of course, for one of them, you have to be an organization. For the other ones, it's okay if you're individual too. You don't become automatically a member. It has to be approved by the executive committee. But once you are approved, you become a member. No membership fee. So, I hope that answers your question.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Before we go to the next question, just a couple of data. Out of more than 300 members of NCSG, 135 are coming from the fellowship program. And out of seven NCUC executive committee members, six, including chair, are coming from the fellowship program. So, there is always a place for newcomers, Next-Genners, fellows, get engaged. So, this is the place for you to get interested more and get engaged. Yes, please, Lily.

LILY EDINAM BOTSYOE: Hi, my name is Lily Edinam Botsyoe, I'm an ICANN81 fellow. So, for all the groups, actually, amazing content and happy to learn about the work you're doing. Most importantly, all of you mentioned that you're actively working around the issues of privacy. Now, one of those that are as popular is WHOIS and now RDRS, which seems to be something that has come up to probably address the issue, right? Aside from that, are there any emerging privacy issues that you're discussing? So, from all the groups, what are they and how can people be a part of it? Thank you.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: There is somebody in this room that has been working on something on privacy proxy. That's an issue. I'm not an expert on it, but that's also something we're working on. And then there's the freedom-- you know, privacy and freedom of expression, there's a thin line between them. And for us, it's also important to understand those things and see where a policy is infringing on either freedom of expression or outright violation of privacy.

So, some of the time, these things are not as clear cut as that, but it's for us to be eagle eye and be looking at them. So, we look at all these issues and depending on even cases of abuse where you're using privacy to more or less cause abuse in some form or the other. So, we look at it, but to just say outrightly and say, oh, which of these issues is privacy or list them out. Off my head right now, I accept vast for help from these other colleagues, but there's a whole lot of them.

And for us, either way, if it affects somebody's legitimate access to information or right to express themselves and violates their human rights, it's a concern for us. So, we'll not be willing to go through the nuances that surrounds it and whatever way is expressed, then we'll go after it. But as far as I'm concerned, we are open to having that conversation and looking into it. Do you want to, yeah?

JULF HELSINGIUS:

Sure, I can add a little bit more. So, specific things that we see coming up on the radar is, for example, the implications of the European NIS2 directives that will have some privacy implications on registrars and registries. And we want to be also reviewing what does that mean for privacy issues. And we're trying to keep our fingers in there and say, hold on.

But on the other hand, it's also, I mean, the other thing is authorization of law enforcement is a big issue. We all agree that, yes, when proper law enforcement wants to catch real baddies, yes, absolutely, we want to support them. But there are a lot of law enforcement that is law enforcement only in name. And it's actually more, for example, really trying to quench down on freedom of expression by tort crime almost.

So, in a sense, there's still a lot of ongoing processes that all have privacy aspects, and we need to kind of keep our fingers in there, which is why we also really welcome you newcomers, because there are so many things going on all the time that we really need engaged people in all those groups. So, thank you for that question.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Yeah, just to add to what those guys said. We also are looking for how to protect our members, our civil society, from their interests, right? It's like the most easy way to try to explain it. It's like, okay, it's like, for example, we have the transfer policy. What information are sharing between the registrars that could not be affect a registrar name holder? That's like a very tiny thing, but it's like just a bit try to explain that. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, Juan. Sana? Raise your hands who wants to ask questions, so I can make sure I see you. Gustavo.

SANA NISAR: Thank you so much for your kind presentation. I'm Sana Nisar from Pakistan, and I'm also a part of ICAN81 fellow. So, I have a question for Benjamin, like, what are the key takeaways on DNS abuse, and the measures taken on to address it, and how the newcomers contribute to the discussion on balancing DNS abuse prevention with protecting civil society rights?

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you. I didn't get your name.

SANA NISAR: Sana.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you. I thought it was Sarah.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Sana Nisar. If you want the surname as well. Sana Nisar.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: I just want to be sure. So this morning-- you know, ICANN has their own-- there's been a lot of argument for a long time, what is DNS abuse? So finally, ICANN came up with a definition. So they listed a couple of things, phishing, squatting, and all of that. So if we take that, that technical definition, and today they played out a list of scenarios that would happen, very vague approaches. So what we found in the process and what was defined is that the understanding we have where you say, oh, I think DNS abuse is happening, you report, and you expect that-- So if you find, like, phishing, for example, where somebody makes something closely look like another thing, and people are misled to think it's the same thing.

So in that case, does the registrar, who is responsible, just remove it, or will you report it to, and all of that? So we found that there's a lot of nuances, a lot of technical issues around it. And one of the things is, who has the right to even report that in the first place? Is it the owner of the person who the phishing is affecting, the owner of the website, somebody who is confused, all of that, and who has, how do you verify who is the rightful person making the complaint? So there's a lot of things that we've seen.

And what we also saw this morning in that exercise is that the registrars who are responsible to either remove, suspend, go through a lot of technical steps, they just don't remove, or delete, or do anything like that, or suspend. So there's still a lot of conversations going on to understand what needs to be done. And one of the understandings I got this morning is that you treat each case on a case-by-case basis. So the best thing I think we could do as a community is to ensure that we educate civil society organizations on what to do if they are affected by this, or to even be aware not to fall a victim of these practices. So those are some of the things that is coming out from today's exercise.

How we're going to deal with it moving forward is still, I think the community will still discuss it. But there's no straight answers based on what I experienced this morning about what it is. I don't know if that's fair enough.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Julf has something to add.

JULF HELSINGIUS: Yes, I just want to address something that's of a common misconception. And talking about what DNS abuse is, we have been very strict about pointing out to everybody that we really have to have a very strict, narrow definition of what DNS abuse is. Because there are some elements in the ICANN space that are trying to push ICANN into dealing with content. And we think that's the road to censorship. And we don't support that at all. And it's very clear in the ICANN bylaws that

that's outside the scope of ICANN. So we keep reminding the organizations in the ICANN space about that. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Lady on the sixth row, please. Yeah, you.

KAROLINA IWANSKA: Thank you very much. My name is Karolina Iwańska. I'm at the European Center for Not-for-Profit Law. We are newcomers to ICANN. This is my first meeting. And we are part of a project called Civil Society Alliances for Digital Empowerment that has the goal of actually increasing civil society participation in the Internet governance, including ICANN.

So my question is really related to that. Earlier in your presentation, Julf, you mentioned there are 314 active members in a Non-Commercial Stakeholders Group. And from an outsider perspective, it seems like a pretty impressive number. So I wanted to better understand how does this relate to other stakeholders? So in a way, how powerful the voice of civil society is in ICANN and how influential it is? And then also, what sort of gaps are you seeing and missing perspectives perhaps within civil society that, considering the current issues that are the object of discussion that NCHG could benefit from in terms of more engagement from particular groups or particular regions? Thank you.

JULF HELSINGIUS: Thank you. It's actually an interesting question. But on the other hand, I would almost argue that it's not very important because it depends on the weight of the number of members. It varies so differently. I mean, if you look at somebody in the GNSO space, for example, at the ISPC, which are Internet service providers, they have a few members, but they are big telecommunication companies. And would what really count and to really boil it down to the practicalities, what it counts is how many votes do you have on the GNSO council? And that's where we are kind of in a very strong position with our six representatives. So we are as powerful as all the commercial stakeholders. And that means we are one fourth of all of GNSO votes. So that's very significant.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: That explains the process, also the powerfulness and the strength, how Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group can influence the decision process, the policy development process. Gustavo, yes, please.

GUSTAVO ORTEGA ALVARADO: Thank you for your presentation. So Gustavo Ortega and a fellow. So I see a lot of overlap of the different topics across every organization. In particular, I will frame my question in regard of one of the organizations I belong. So I'm a member of board of the Internet Society, specifically one chapter, the San Francisco Bay chapter. And well, the chapter is basically affiliated with ICANN through NARALO as an At-Large structure.

So some of the topics that you cover within this particular membership are already being developed within that particular nature of affiliation. So how different would that be when we affiliate here? Because I see that being in the Internet Society as a civil society and as a technical group as well. There is also more of the potential, the potentiality to be affiliated within this particular supporting organization rather than also that At-Large. And basically, I think the here, the possibility to collaborate on other topics as well could be supported. So what specifically would you say, would you recommend for somebody for me that belongs to this sort of organizations? Thank you.

JULF HELSINGIUS:

Thank you. And that's a great question. We actually have a lot of members who are also ISOC members and active in ISOC chapters. I personally, until last year, was chair of one of the chapters. We cooperate with At-Large, a lot, we have common members, but there's a very important distinction that ALAC is an advisory organization that covers the whole space, whereas GNSO very specifically does policy and produces the documents that ICANN actually follows.

So if you actually want to set policy for domains, GNSO is where you have to be. So they have different roles. And we share a lot of members and we cooperate where we can. But there are some things where we totally disagree. And especially historically, there have been parts of ALAC that haven't been as privacy friendly, for example, as we have been. But so we try to find compromises. But again, we are focused on specific policy, whereas ALAC is a general advisory body.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. Yes, please, Ida.

IDA PADIKUOR NA-TEI: Okay. thank you for your presentation. My name is Ida Na-Tei and I'm an ICANN81 fellow. During the break, I went to the gTLD stand and I got an idea as to how much it costs to register a gTLD. Now, you mentioned that you are doing some work in promoting the acceptance of gTLD registration by small non-for-profits. My question is, now that I have an idea of the cost of registration, which is six figures kind of, what are you doing to support small nonprofits financially so that they can actually register beyond advocating for them to accept their applications? Is that something you're doing to support them financially or advocate so that finances are made available to them? Because as you said, they are small non-for-profits. Thank you.

JULF HELSINGIUS: Thank you. And yes, the price of domains is a big problem for smaller organizations. And that's why we've been very active in pushing soft in the application support program. And pretty much you have to look at the application support program in its current form as it's coming out for the soft new domains. We have pushed it as hard as we have been able to to make sure there's enough support and also financial incentives and support measures for small applicants. But there's also always limits for what we can do. But we have been pushing very hard.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Pedro, you want to relate it to this question? Okay.

PEDRO LANA: Just in addition, our NCUC issue forum that will happen on Tuesday will be exactly about this application support program. We will be doing a workshop explaining it, trying to make it as didactic as possible, dividing in sections. A lot of NCUC, NPOC and NCSG members will be explaining each section. So we can create new leaders regarding the issue so they can themselves try to explain and promote this initiative in their regions, in their communities all around the world. So please, it would be interesting to have newcomers in this sessions NCUC issue forum.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yes, Benjamin.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: So whatever came out of the applicant support, the official documents, I can tell you that we asked for everything. We asked for money, we asked for support, we asked for technical assistance, everything possible to make it easy for a small NGO to be able to apply. But we didn't get everything, but we got fair enough, but we asked for everything. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. We have a fellow who participates virtually, Saba Tiku. And Sabah, you can unmute yourself and ask your question, please.

SABA TIKU BEYENE:

Thank you very much for the floor, Siranush, and thank you, Benjamin, for the wonderful presentation. I'm Saba from Ethiopia and ICANN81 fellow. So I'm really curious about how the NCUC works to make sure that the non-commercial voices are heard, not just within ICANN, but across the wider internet governance landscape. So could you share some of the ways that the NCUC advocates for the non-commercial interests and where it has had an impact? Are there any specific examples where the NCUC's involvement has influenced major discussions or decisions on the issues that are important to non-commercial users? And one last question. Earlier, you presented about the membership application and I missed out on which one requires an organization and which one one can join in in their own capacity, which means individually. Thank you very much.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

So the main question was if NCUC has any success stories in the major discussions which went through. I mean, you can say that, okay, this is the topic we have discussed and we got the ultimate, we reached the ultimate goal.

And the second question was, can you explain one more time where the individuals can be a member in which group and where the organizations can be a member of? And if anything is wrong, you can add Saba in the chat space. Thank you.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Thank you, Saba. So I think I've mentioned this a lot of time, but I'm not tired of repeating it. I think the applicant support is one of the applicant's support guidebook and some of the things you'll find inside of it. It's something that we can be proud of in the new gTLD program. There are other things, but it's difficult in a multi-stakeholder arrangement to claim sole responsibility of an outcome because it's a consensus issues. You have to convince other community members to join your argument.

Also, I mean, coincidentally, the GDPR against the WHOIS, having WHOIS offline right now, having RDRS coming on board, it's some things we can be proud of, like we have been advocating for and we are beginning to see things like that. So it's a long, it's a marathon. It's not a sprint. So some of these advocacies take years and you just need to follow continuously to see where it finally lands. And the fact that we are still here and our commercial perspective is always considered in all of these issues, shows the relevance and the work that we do. But it's difficult to say, oh, NCUC is responsible for only this. But I can reach out to other community members here if anything comes in mind that they can mention as something we can say solely NCUC is responsible for. But the balanced perspective you see in ICANN is also because we keep advocating.

But I'll quickly go to something that I think I can answer clearly right now. And it's the fact that if you go to our website, NCUC.org, you will see join as a member. And once you click on that form, it tells you if you can be an individual member or an organization member, that arrangement is available within NCUC. Also, if you go to MPOC, you

have similar arrangement. But I'll give Juan one time to also mention that. So I hope those answers your questions. If not, you can always send me an email or catch me on the aisles and I would explain more. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Saba means actually related to Internet governance landscape. So you're all within that landscape. So I asked to clarify. Still waiting. But if it relates to Internet governance landscape.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: I mean, we yes. NCUC members also have, as I told you before, we have researchers, we have advocates. So in some other places you will see like someone like Milton, who is doing Internet governance project. These are huge influences around the world. And they have-- the fact that when you talk about Internet governance and human rights come right on top of the radar as well is because there are advocates who keep championing issues that relates to human rights, freedom of expression, privacy, anti-censorship issues. I mean, even if you look at the meeting in Brazil, NETMundial, those kind of conversations is because the civil society organizations rally together and ensure that not only the big tech influence the conversation around Internet governance.

The fact that we see all of those conversations were highly represented in all these conversations. It's not just says NCUC going around here. NCUC is primarily active within the ICANN multistakeholder space. But

our members are spread across in different consortium arrangements in other Internet governance mechanisms.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS

Now, just to add that in the first thing, it's like Julf said that the policy works at NCSG level. So our influence, as Julf says, is an NCSG level, not at a constituency level. So that's important thing. And another thing is the Internet governance landscape. We have members in almost each country, in many countries. And most of our members are part of their local IGF.

So there are member trying to member to organize a committee or just a speaker being a main speaker in that IGF, in local IGF or regional IGF. So I think that can be show that it's yeah, we are active here in ICANN as a stakeholder group, but we are not just here because we are civil society and we are volunteers also. So we have jobs, daily jobs, and we need to share our daily job with these volunteer activities. So that's it.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Thank you. I think we are about to finish our session and I would suggest that you go and download the slides, visit the websites and links put there, get more information and have the opportunity during the coming week, meet these people, talk to these people, meet the executive committee members from NCUC, leadership from NCSG and NPOC. And now you already know what does it mean, what they are stands for, those acronyms. So learn more and engage. And if you feel

comfortable and see yourself as part of those groups, there is an application process that has been set, apply and be part of it.

With that, I would like to thank my presenters today. It was great presentation of non-commercial stakeholder users and I appreciate your time. With that, the meeting is adjourned. Thank you very much. We can stop the recording.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]