Recognition and Redistribution: Perspective for Equity and Engagement for ELs

CABE
Long Beach March 21, 2019

Dr. Jose Lakos
Maria Ordaz
Heidi Stelkensta
Michelle Schindler
- University of Redlands
- Santa Maria USD
- Santa Barbara USD

Agenda

✓ Welcome
✓ Learning Outcomes
✓ Define Recognition and Redistribution
✓ Discussion and Reflection Throughout
✓ Why is Equity Important for ELs?
✓ Definitions and Manifestations of Social and Cultural Capital on ELs
✓ Highlight different types of Engagement
✓ Demonstration on how Motivation lead to Student Engagement
✓ What are the Indicators and Facilitators of Engagement?
✓ Research Findings on Student Engagement for ELs
✓ From Engagement to Empowerment

What do you hope to get out of this session on Recognition and Redistribution: Perspective for Equity and Engagement for ELs?

Write it on post-its
Share out whole group
The Complexity and Importance of Engagement

Research on motivation and engagement is essential to understanding some of the most fundamental and vexing challenges of school reform.

-National Research Council's Committee on Increasing High School Students' Engagement and Motivation to Learn (2004)

Define Engagement

What does engagement:
Look like
Sound like
Feel like

What is...

In your groups use the chart paper to document your responses.
Be prepared to share out.

Learning Outcomes

To understand the need for recognition and redistribution in creating equity for ELLs.
To understand the manifestations of social and cultural capital as facilitators of student engagement.
To understand the different types of engagement, what the indicators are, and how to facilitate student engagement.
To understand the motivation and practical implementations of facilitating student engagement.
Recognition & Redistribution as an equity solution for ELs

Why is Recognition Important?

"Ideologies are the big shared ideas of society that are reinforced throughout the institutions and thus are very hard to avoid believing" (Saxo & DiAngelo, 2012, p. 43).

What are the shared ideas in society in regards to EL’s? How are EL’s viewed?

How are these beliefs reinforced within the educational system?

What is a Paradigm?

This concept regarding ideologies as the big shared ideas reinforced with institutions is what Kuhn refers to as Paradigm.

Paradigm is defined by Kuhn as:

"Shared images, assumptions, and practices that characterize a community of scholars in a given field". (p.80)

Thus, educators need to become critically aware of their paradigm and how that affects the pedagogy that is reflected inside the classroom.

This starts with Recognition...
As an educator, what does recognition of English Language Learning mean to you?

Recognition
Using Paul Gee’s tag “D” Discourse

Social Cultural Indicators

Students
Geography/Ethnic
Cultural background

Ongoing knowledge

Identity
History
Religion
Traditions
Values
Communities/Neighborhoods

Defined

"Ways of using language acting, interacting, valuing, desiring, thinking, believing, and feeling...to get recognized as having a specific social identity" (2014, p. 14).

Why is Recognition Important?

"nonrecognition and misrecognition...can be a form of oppression, imprisoning someone in a false, distorted, reduced mode of being. Beyond simple lack of respect, it can inflict a grievous wound,师生ing people with crippling self-hatred. Due recognition is not just a courtesy, but a vital human need. (Gee, 1997, p. 14; Freire & Freire, 2000)

Think Pair Share: Do you agree with this quote? Why or Why Not?
Share Out

"Nonrecognition and misrecognition... can be a form of oppression, imprisoning someone in a false, distorted, reduced mode of being. Beyond simple lack of respect it can inflict a grievous wound, saddling people with creeping self-hatred. Due recognition is not just a courtesy, but a vital human need." (Isher, 1997, p. 14, Fraser & Honneth, 2003)

- What's going on in your school community?

Do you recognize the challenges our EIs face on a daily basis?

Taking a deeper look into your community?
Looking at the Map
Where can a SBCUSD student live in this community where they are not directly affected by this type of violence or a negative perception of their community?

Recognition is vital human need.
crimemapping.com

2,261 crimes currently reported in 2018-2019 school year:
August: 351
September: 385
October: 433
November: 346
December: Jan: 759
Serious Crime Reporting within 2 mile radius.

Negative Perception of the Community
"But as professionals continue to flee into the nearby enclaves of East Highlands, Yacula, and Redlands, the city of San Bernardino, which saw its glory days spike in the late 1970's will continue to head down the drain and unfortunately become an area only for those who have no aspirations to exceed in life."
Personal Application
Think of an EL that struggles in your classroom?
What does he or she value?
What knowledge and experiences do they bring into the classroom?
How can you make the content meaningful to that student?

Why do we need Recognition?
- Injustices are rooted in social and cultural patterns in society...
  - Representation
  - Interpretation
  - Communication

Meaning-Making Dimensions of Human Practices
Teachers as Cultural Workers

"Cultural workers are those people who are engaged in public meaning-making activities, and teachers are key public figures in the making of meaning for young people." (Selman, 2016, p.6)

Pedagogical and curriculum choices
Plan lessons
Teach

Meaning Making's Dynamic Process

1) Representation: Deliberate use of available resources and tools for representation and other expressive materials.
2) Communication: Making sense by reconstructing the available resources and tools for representation.
3) Interpretation: Transforming understanding that equates to learning.
Freire: Critical Pedagogy—"Banking Concept"

- Make deposit
- Is categorized
- Is stored
- Is filed away

---

Two Different Approaches

**Banking Teacher**
1. Sees on object
2. Inductive Tatcher
3. Lectures and holds all the knowledge
4. Resists dialogue
5. Inhibits creativity
6. Sees students as blank slates to be filled
7. Is a manager of learning

**Problem-posing Teacher:**
1. Sees a person
2. Collaborative grouping
3. Instigates critical thinking discussions and reflection
4. Encourages dialogue
5. Inclines creative assignments
6. Values the diversity and knowledge of students
7. Is a facilitator of learning

---

What is the difference between

**EQUALITY**
Equality means everyone receives the same resources regardless of need.

**EQUITY**
Equity ensures everyone has what they need to succeed.
Why is Redistribution Important?

The Problem
- Material inequality: Those who have and those who do not have.
- "Inequality is inevitable" (Schinderman, 2018, p.4)

Including:
- Income
- Property
- Access to education
- Access to nutritional foods
- Health Care
- Exposure to Pollution
- Mortality Rates

Equality

Equality imagines an equal world.

Inequality is Inevitable!

But the world ISN'T EQUAL.
For example, some societies have a Racialized System.

Is everyone really equal?

Equality

- Race
- Ethnicity
- Religion
- Language
- Ability/disability conditions
- Gender
- Sexual orientation
- Social class
- Citizenship status
Why do we need to provide equity in the classroom?

Access: but is providing access enough?
Know who our students are
Motivation
Identity development
Engagement
Achievement

Critical Theory of Recognition and Redistribution Leads to Equity
In order to address inequities, we must balance and support both the notions of recognition and redistribution through:

- Identifying and Defending categories of difference
- Providing Cultural Recognition and Redistribution of resources and services in forms that support each other
- Addressing the interlocking forces where cultural disadvantage also means cultural disrespect.

"Oppression is a multi-dimensional imbalance of social, political, and institutional power that builds over time and becomes normalized" (Perry & Ehrlich, 2013, p.44).

A Teacher’s Role as “Cultural Workers”

Affirm or contest dominant public discourses and existing values, knowledge, dispositions, and ideologies.
Affirm or contest existing and established practices in schools and broader communities as producers of pedagogies and identities for students.
Help students produce and interpret experiences in social situations while engaged in exchanging meanings.
Are we affirming or contesting our English Language Learners' current academic performance?

The Problem

There continues to be an achievement gap for our English Language Learners, compared to English only students.

Qualitative

Using observations and interviews, we were able to capture the essence of social and school capital as facilitators of student engagement.

Methodology

"Our experiences are always our own, but they are shaped by the social, cultural, and institutional narratives in which individuals are embedded." (Bakhtin, 2008 from the Handbook of Narrative Inquiry: Mapping a Methodology)
Manifestations of Social and cultural capital as facilitators of student engagement.

Social & Cultural Capital: English Learners Voices

**Purpose:**
1. Gather and examine the perspectives of school personnel and students concerning the influence of social and cultural capital including language on the engagement of EL students
2. Provide reflective opportunities to educators on how they engage EL students within their classrooms

**Methodology:** Narrative Inquiry
**Sampling:** Purposive and Convenient

- Social Capital: Networks of relationships that bind and bridge people together.
Manifestations of Social Capital as Facilitators of Engagement

Success
- "I think there's a lot of success when kids are Mastery oriented but they're also learning something new." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Student)

Identity
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)

Access
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)

Relationships & Trust
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)

Expectations
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
- "I think it's important for kids to know that they are successful with their learning." (Teacher)
Manifestations of Social Capital as Facilitators of Engagement

Awareness
- "You need to judge their performance when they are in your room and talk by having individual time and give them a visible hint that you are there for them. Sometimes, the student doesn't even work hard and connected because they are hungry. Teach them why it's important and value a culture too, not just academic." (Teacher)
- "It's hard for me to speak and write in other languages. Sometimes"

Commitment to Cultural Diversity
- "We had Hispanic Heritage Month a few weeks ago and the school did an art project with posters on subjects..." (Teacher)
- "We get through it because they teach their language and they would go to there who came to the administrators and then we had a couple groups of students..."

Social & Cultural Capital: English Learners

Implications:
1. Ensure there's a clear link between curriculum and instruction so that students can sustain their individual identity and help practitioners to provide access to all students regarding language development.
2. Professional learning taken place for classroom teachers and administrators regarding understanding linguistic needs of English language students based on self-compassion theory.
3. Having a network with other professionals on how to understand the instruction that English language students have. Reflecting on best and worst practices so that English learners will assist in providing positive outcomes.

Facilitators and Indicators of Student Engagement
**Types of Student Engagement**

- Content
- Process
- Attitude
- Focus
- Agency

**Definition of Student Engagement**

"The student's psychological investment in, and effort directed toward, learning, understanding, or mastering the knowledge, skills, and crafts that academic work is intended to promote." (Kuh, 1993, p. 12)

"A broad construct intended to encompass salient academic as well as certain non-academic aspects of the student experience", comprising the following (Kuh, 2007, p. 132):

- Participation in shaping academic activities
- Intellectual engagement with academic study
- Engagement in learning beyond the classroom
- Feeling intellectually and personally engaged

**What is Engagement?**

It's a multidimensional construct consisting of affective, behavioral, and cognitive components.

- Affective engagement reflects interests, enjoyment, and enthusiasm.
- Behavioral engagement demonstrates actual participation with effort and attention.
- Cognitive engagement manifests mindful behavior, persistence, and metacognition.

(Fredricks, Blumenfeld, & Paris, 2004)
Student Engagement

**Academic engagement:** attendance and completing assignments in class and at home or participating in extracurricular activities (Fox & Zimmer, 2012)

How do you identify? — ongoing participation, focus, hard work, involvement, concentration, and/or effort in doing academic-related work at school, home, and community

---

Student Engagement

**Social Engagement:** attending school regularly, coming to school and class on time, exhibiting kindness and caring attitude toward other students, and not disrespecting other students (Fox & Zimmer, 2012)

How do you identify? — appropriate interaction with classmates and the teacher, attention to relevant class activities, following directions, and speaking politely,

---

Student Engagement

**Affective engagement:** feelings of being involved in school as a positive and caring place where activities are worth pursuing (Fox & Zimmer, 2012)

How do you identify? — students’ enthusiasm, enjoyment, satisfaction, and pride to participate in school activities and to be resilient in dealing with peers and in doing school tasks. There is feeling of belongingness in the school community that school prepares them for out-of-school tasks and challenges.
Student Engagement

Cognitive engagement: to comprehend complex ideas in order to achieve mastery of the subject matter. (Hew & Brush, 2013)

How do you identify? – asking critical questions, willingness to participate in challenging tasks, reading more references than the assigned material, using self-regulation, self-monitoring, and other cognitive strategies to guide learning, and examining ideas, concepts, and events carefully by using research and other authentic sources.

AGENTIC ENGAGEMENT

student-initiated pathway to greater achievement and greater motivational support “students’ constructive contribution into the flow of the instruction they receive”

Research Based Understanding of Student Engagement

- We wanted to do the story of a successful student engagement in a Brown University’s academic area to demonstrate that student engagement is not based on instruction or language, but other faculties and indicators.
- Research shows that parent involvement teachers have the most influence on student engagement. By doing observation and interviews we were able to the essence of student engagement. We discovered the how engagement can be used to inform teacher practice.

Authentic Teacher Voice

- During the teacher interviews, comparing what the teachers said to what we observed in the classroom, makes emerged.

(Gale, Hinch, and Brindell, 2019)
Research Population

- 87% Student population are EL's
- 10% African American
- 2% White
- 1% Asian

The Participants

1st Grade
- 11 yrs. experience

3rd Grade
- 6 yrs. experience

6th Grade
- 5 yrs. experience

TSA
- 13 yrs. experience

We wanted to capture the story of engagement from cross-sectioned grade levels to ensure fidelity and authenticity of the themes that emerged.

Interview Structure

- Four interviews
  - Four different teachers
  - Four different grade levels
- 20 to 30 minutes in length
- Semi-structured
- Open for follow up questions
Teacher's Definition of Student Engagement

Interview 1
Definition of Student Engagement: They are talking, they are focused, they are engaged.

Interview 2
Definition of Student Engagement: They are doing the work, they are responsible for their own learning.

Interview 3
Definition of Student Engagement: When students are paying attention, taking notes, and following directions.

Interview 4
Definition of Student Engagement: When students are participating in class discussions and answering questions.

Evidence and Classroom Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Evidence and Classroom Practices</th>
<th>Critical Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student/Teacher Connections</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning and Caring Disposition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rewarding/Recognizing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Expectations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acceptability</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrating Interest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Validation of Evidence

- Coding: The researchers went line by line through each transcript and used open coding to identify repeated words and phrases.
- Through the coding process of the interviews and observations, three themes emerged.

Summary of Findings

Facilitators of Engagement

Students are now identifying with the literature, with their culture. They are now walking with their heads held up.

Facilitators of Student Engagement
Recommendations for Future Research

1. Starting in the beginning of a school year, assess participating teachers to give them different levels of engagement and its impact.

2. Ongoing assessments throughout the school year in order to evaluate and understand how to promote learning. Also, look at student content assessments and measure if student growth mirrors the different levels of engagement.

3. Feedback from students to determine factors for successful engagement.

Research-based ideas for professional development

---

Re-define Engagement

Has your understanding of engagement increased?

- Look Like
- Sound Like
- Feel Like

In your groups, look at your original definition of engagement. Does it need to be modified? If so, enrich it to include the true and complete essence of engagement.
What form of engagement is demonstrated in this video?

Evaluate

In the video, how does the teacher quickly use social engagement? What made it effective?

Where does Student Engagement Start?
Engagement starts with...

Engagement must start with the teacher being willing to release some authority.

- Allow students time to make meaning of the content through discussion and share ideas.
- Ask high levels of questioning to facilitate cognitive thinking.
- Provide meaningful and positive classroom experiences.

Motivational Constructs

- Sense of Belonging: identity
- Competence: self-esteem
- Autonomy: power
- Meaningfulness

(Turner, Christensen, Kasten-Conrck, Traverse, & Fulker, 2014)

"People lack motivation when they do not feel competent and that the value in what they are doing." (Ryan & Deci, p.46)

What enhances student engagement?

Providing motivational opportunities for students to experience:

- belongingness in the classroom
- competence in performing and organizing a particular task
- autonomy in pursuing their individual interests and beliefs
- meaningful learning

(Turner, Christensen, Kasten-Conrck, Traverse, & Fulker, 2014)
Teachers as Cultural Workers

"Cultural workers are those people who are engaged in public meaning-making activities, and teachers are key public figures in the making of meaning for young people." (Salman, 2018, p.6)

Pedagogical and curriculum choices
Plan lessons
Teach

The BIG "WHY" for an Equity-Centered Curriculum

Strive for Equality and address inequality
Provide Equity — access is not enough; motivating students is key
Engage all students including EL

THANK YOU!

○ You can reach us at:
  Josie.Tillett@jefferson.edu
  brian.wilkins@jefferson.edu
  Maria.Ortiz@jefferson.edu
  Michelle.Scipioni@jefferson.edu
Percent meeting or exceeding standards on SBAC math
All grades, by English Learner Status (2014-15 to 2017-18)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>English Learner</th>
<th>English Only</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2014-15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015-16</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-17</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GAPS: ENGLISH LEARNERS

Percent meeting or exceeding standards on SBAC ELA
All grades, by English Learner Status (2014-15 to 2017-18)

- **2014-15**: English Learner 11, English Only 44
- **2015-16**: English Learner 12, English Only 48
- **2016-17**: English Learner 12, English Only 56
- **2017-18**: English Learner 13, English Only 56