Providing Productive Feedback to English Learners on Verbal and Written Errors

Featured Full-Day Institute
CABE 2017 Conference Anaheim, CA 3.31.17

Kate Kinsella, Ed.D.
Center for Teacher Efficacy
San Francisco State University
katek@sfsu.edu

Institute Objectives
Participants will learn effective ways to:
- Explicitly communicate and teach language targets
- Write response frames that guide accurate oral fluency
- Monitor language production during collaborative tasks
- Provide productive feedback on verbal production errors
- Address fossilized errors in written work
- Identify and prioritize written errors for explicit instruction
- Coach students in gaining control over written errors

CA CCSS and the ELD Standards: Key Premises
- Using English purposefully
- Interacting in meaningful ways
- Understanding how English works

Key ELA and ELD Academic Interaction Standards:

Collaborative/Exchanging Ideas

Sample Language Objectives
- State a claim using present tense persuasive verbs: believe, maintain, contend.
- Exchange information on a topic by asking relevant questions and affirming others: What do you think makes sense? That makes sense. That would work.
- Report a group’s consensus using past tense citation verbs + that: decided, determined.

The Neglected “R” in Instruction for Academic English Learners

Which “R” is frequently missing from lessons for academic English learners?
- Rigor
- Relevance
- Relationships
- Responses

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2017 ~ All rights reserved. Do not modify or distribute electronically without permission.
The Goal of Lessons Focused on English Language Development

- How can we dramatically increase the quality and quantity of verbal and written interactions in academic register each student experiences, through explicit instruction, modeling, consistent routines, and structured, meaningful lesson tasks?

Language Functions (Purposes) Within Academic Interaction

- Stating opinions
- Restating
- Eliciting responses
- Agreeing/Disagreeing
- Clarifying
- Validating
- Holding the Floor
- Drawing conclusions
- Providing Evidence
- Comparing/Contrasting
- Supporting/Elaborating
- Predicting
- Negotiating
- Reporting

Academic Language to State an Opinion

Everyday English
- I think __. I don’t think __.

Academic English
- I think __ because __.
- I (firmly, strongly) believe __.
- In my opinion __.
- From my perspective __.
- I am convinced __.

Academic Language to Support an Opinion

Everyday English
- Because __.

Academic English
- For (example, instance), __.
- A relevant example I (heard, read) was __.
- One (possible, convincing) reason is __.
- A (key, major) reason is __.
- A relevant experience I had was __.

Academic Language to Provide Evidence

Everyday English
- Because __.

Academic English
- After hearing __, I am convinced __.
- The data on __ suggests __.
- After reading __, I conclude that __.
- After reviewing __, I assume that __.
- Drawing from evidence, I know that __.

Academic Interaction Card: Expanding and Bridging ELs

1. Stating Opinions
   - I think __.
   - I don’t think __.

2. Supporting/Elaborating
   - For (example, instance), __.
   - A relevant example I heard/read was __.
   - One (possible, convincing) reason is __.

3. Providing Evidence
   - Based on experience, it seems evident that __.
   - From my perspective, __.
   - In my opinion __.
   - I (firmly, strongly) believe __.

4. Comparing/Contrasting
   - My analysis on this topic, level, etc. __.
   - No, not exactly. What I said meant __.
   - Yes, that’s right.

5. Agreeing/Disagreeing
   - I disagree (somewhat, completely).
   - I (firmly, strongly) believe (Name’s) __.
   - I think __. I don’t think __.

6. Restating
   - I see what you’re saying.
   - That’s a great idea.
   - That makes sense.

7. Validating
   - That’s worth considering.
   - No, not exactly. What I (said, meant) was __.
   - So, you’re suggesting that __.

8. Clarifying
   - That’s a great idea.
   - So, your (idea, opinion, response) is __.
   - So, you think that __.

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2017 ~ All rights reserved. Do not modify or distribute electronically without permission.
**Academic Discussion Routine**

Routine Phases:
- **Brainstorm** (Think)
- **Record** (Write)
- **Exchange** (Pair)
- **Report** (Share)

**Instructional Advantages of Academic Response Frames**

A well-crafted response frame enables a teacher to 1) **construct** a model response, 2) **deconstruct** the response, and 3) expect students to **reconstruct** a competent response.

**Academic Discussion Scaffold**

**Brainstorm**
- List possible ways to earn respect from your peers.

**Record**
- Create a record of contributions.

**Exchange**
- Pair students to share their ideas.

**Report**
- Share findings with the class.

**Student Progress Monitoring**

- A practice that helps teachers within early literacy programs or serving students receiving special education services use performance data to frequently evaluate the effectiveness of their lessons as means of helping a student meet achievement goals on a target competency such as decoding, and make informed decisions about content to reteach, grouping arrangements, and instructional time.

**ELD Lesson Monitoring**

- A practice utilized by teachers within a **designated** or **integrated** English language development lesson to make informed and immediate adjustments in content, pacing, instructional delivery, and/or classroom management to enhance student learning and engagement.

**Non-Priorities in ELD Lesson Monitoring**

- Content coverage at the expense of student learning and quality interactions
- Identifying primarily the strongest answers
- Admonishing and terrorizing reticent contributors (i.e. “non-volunteers”)
- Behavior management
**Aims of ELD Lesson Monitoring (1)**
- Ensuring students are on task and successfully tackling assignment demands.
- Making the teacher accessible to students who have clarifying questions or needs.
- Gauging whether the pace of instructional delivery is or was appropriate.
- Circulating strategically to assess a range of student work or interactions.
- Identifying issues among individual, pair, and group progress.

**Aims of ELD Lesson Monitoring (2)**
- Taking opportunities for micro-teaching to individuals, pairs, or groups who have not grasped the linguistic, conceptual, or procedural demands of the assignment.
- Listening for English language production errors, when accuracy is a lesson objective.
- Reading written work and assessing the conceptual integrity and linguistic accuracy.
- Facilitating when learners can’t sustain interaction(s) or comprehend each other.

**Aims of ELD Lesson Monitoring ()**
- Coaching audible interactions between peers and during unified-class discussions.
- Identifying prospective contributors (with a range of responses, not simply the outstanding) for follow-up discussion.
- Noting who is contributing voluntarily and enlisting more reticent contributors in a supportive manner.
- Providing feedback that is timely, respectful, corrective, and focused on specific criteria.

**Brief Partner Interaction**
- What did you learn in your pre-service credentialing or CLAD certification coursework about correcting English learner verbal errors?
- What method of treatment was optimal and for what reasons?

**Less Effective Feedback Strategies**

**Complete Neglect**
- **Pros:** Requires no time, effort or training, and maintains lesson pacing
- **Cons:** Leads to “fossilized errors” when students practice errors into permanence

**Recasts (sans prior instruction)**
- **Pros:** Merely requires attentive listening on the teacher’s part to be able to repeat the utterance correctly; Less disruptive of lesson flow than prompts
- **Cons:** Does not yield a high rate of “uptake” or student repair, particularly with less proficient students
Implicit Feedback (Recasts)
The teacher reformulates what the student was trying to say, incorporating correction without overtly noting the error.

Explicit Feedback (Prompts)
The teacher explicitly draws the student’s attention to the error and coaches or requires the student to attempt to repair the utterance.

Merely repairing and repeating the student’s utterance without overt and appropriate coaching and correction results in the learner:

- perceiving that s/he is being affirmed
- perceiving that the teacher is repeating to verify the response or make it audible
- failing to grasp the implicit error correction
- likely to repeat the error in the future


Determine whether the error represents a language target you have formally and adequately addressed and can thus hold the student accountable for self-correction

Determine whether it makes more sense to rectify the error right after production or at a later point in the lesson to not disrupt student interaction and idea flow

Weigh the relative importance of the error in terms of the lesson’s focal language, content and skill objectives

Ask the entire class to introspect rather than put the spotlight solely on the contributor

Have partners discuss how to remedy the error and prepare to report their thinking

Common and Persistent EL Errors

Verb Tense (incorrect verb tense)
I have a reading problem since I begin to study in the United States.

Verb Consistency (inappropriate shifts in verb tense)
I study with the television on sometimes when I was in high school because I am not interested in my homework.

Verb Form (verb incorrectly formed)
I have studying English for three years and I did not made a lot of progress.

Modal (incorrect use or formation of a modal)
I should had read the chapter twice to get a better understanding.

Sentence Structure (incorrect or awkward sentence structure)
There are more than me in this class have a problem with reading the textbook.

Subject-Verb Agreement (incorrect subject-verb agreement)
My brother bother me a lot when I am trying to do my homework.

Word Order (incorrect or awkward word order)
I don’t understand what is the author talking about in this article.

Word Choice (wrong word choice, including prepositions)
My teacher discussed me about my paper in her office.

I feel very frustrated on my Biology class because I have trouble noting.

Word Forms (wrong word form)
My apartment is a distraction place to do my homework.

My sister can easy to read English books, but not me.

I have difficult to finish all my assignments on time.

Verb Complements (form of a verbal/verb complement is incorrect)
I enjoy to study English vocabulary.

I don’t want discussing my paper with other students.

Article (incorrect or missing article)
I don’t make a progress in my English reading.

I hope University will help me to improve my writing and reading ability.

I haven’t decided on the college major.

Countable and Uncountable Nouns (a problem with the singular or plural form of a countable or uncountable noun in English)
I don’t understand the feedbacks on my essay.

I did a lot of researches for this paper, and I don’t know how to organize them.

I skim all the page before I read the chapter to see what it is about.

A Fossilized Error

An error that a student (English Learner or native English speaker) has been making verbally for an extended period of time that has become part of the speaker’s linguistic schema (e.g., omitting the –s on plural nouns) so the student is essentially writing what s/he has been saying (without intervention or productive correction) for years.
In my opinion, graffiti is vandalism if it ruin property. For example, the Boys and Girls Club in my neighborhood was cover with gang symbol. As a result, many parent are really worry about it and don’t let their childrens go there any more.

A "global error" is a more serious error in a piece of writing. A global error interferes with the reader’s ability to understand an entire sentence or paragraph within a piece of writing. A global error usually affects syntax and cohesion. A global error may also be a less serious yet high frequency error, such as an incorrect or missing article, which the writer makes throughout a large portion of the text.

A "local error" is a less serious error in a piece of writing. A local error is generally confined to a single clause and therefore affects only a small part of a sentence. While a local error may indeed be distracting and annoying, it usually does not impair the intelligibility of an entire sentence or paragraph. A local error will become a more serious global error if it appears frequently within a portion of the text.
Analyzing Language Demands of the CA CCSS and ELD Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade 5</th>
<th>CA CCSS for ELA [1.] Speaking and Listening: Comprehension and Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Speaking &amp; Listening 5.1</td>
<td>Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 5 topics and texts, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>Come to discussions prepared, having read or studied required material; explicitly draw on that preparation and other information known about the topic to explore ideas under discussion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>Follow agreed-upon rules for discussions and carry out assigned roles.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
<td>Pose and respond to specific questions by making comments that contribute to the discussion and elaborate on the remarks of others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>Review the key ideas expressed and draw conclusions in light of information and knowledge gained from the discussions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ENGLISH LANGUAGE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS Part I: A. Collaborative

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade 5</th>
<th>[1.] Exchanging Information/Ideas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXPANDING</td>
<td>Contribute to class, group, and partner discussions, including sustained dialogue, by following turn-taking rules, asking relevant questions, affirming others, and adding relevant information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRIDGING</td>
<td>Contribute to class, group, and partner discussions, including sustained dialogue, by following turn-taking rules, asking relevant questions, affirming others, adding relevant information, building on responses, and providing useful feedback.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language Objectives within the ACADEMIC DISCUSSION ROUTINE Interacting in Meaningful Ways:

**Productive:**
- **Record** a quick list of ideas on a focused topic prior to constructing a formal statement.
- **Select** precise words for a formal written statement: *adjectives, gerunds (verb + ing).*
- **Write** a formal statement using *simple present tense, precise adjectives, and gerunds.*

**Collaborative:**
- **Exchange** ideas on the lesson topic with a partner (contribute to discussions), alternating sentence frames (follow turn-taking rules).
- **State** opinions on the lesson topic (contribute to discussions) by using a complete sentence and precise word choices: *non-count nouns, adjectives, gerunds (verb + ing).*
- **Specify** quantity (add relevant information) using a precise adjective: *all, many, some.*
- **Elaborate** on a formal statement (add relevant information) with a concrete example using an appropriate transition: *For instance; For example.*
- **Listen** attentively, **restate** a partner’s idea, and **record** brief notes using precise phrases: *So, your experience is that…? Yes, that’s correct. No, what I said was… (affirming others)*
- **Compare** ideas during class discussion (build on responses) using complete sentences and precise phrases: *My (example, experience) _ is (similar, comparable)_ to (Name’s) _.*
COLLABORATIVE DISCUSSIONS: Sample Language Objectives

Vague Statement: Engage in a range of collaborative discussions.

What this really means . . .

• Discuss prior knowledge of a topic (what makes someone a good friend) prior to reading a text, using appropriate register, complete sentences, and gerunds: helping, assisting, listening, defending, sharing, complimenting, recommending.

• Facilitate a collaborative small-group discussion of a topic by following turn-taking rules and eliciting ideas with precise questions: So, __, what are your thoughts?; (Name), what can you add?; So, __, what’s your experience?

• Exchange information on a topic by asking relevant questions and affirming others: What do you think makes sense? That makes sense. That would work.

• State an opinion on an issue by first qualifying a point of view using precise phrases: Based on my experiences as a __; Drawing on my experiences as a __.

• Listen attentively, restate a partner’s idea, and take brief notes using precise phrases: So, your (opinion, perspective, point of view) is that ___?

• Compare experiences using complete sentences and key phrases: My experience is (similar to, somewhat similar to; different than; somewhat different than) yours.

• Facilitate discussion within a group by eliciting responses using appropriate phrases: I am eager to hear from __; I would like to hear from __; I’m interested in __’s response.

• Describe the effects of a person’s behavior using a complex sentence with present tense verbs: When my partner __ (verb + s), I __ (feel, understand, know) __.

• Predict informational text content and structure using a complex sentence with precise nouns to name text features and future tense: Based on the __ (title, heading, graphic aid, highlighted words), I predict the text will focus on __.

• Articulate the key idea and details in an informational text using precise academic terms: text topic, focus, key idea, detail.

• Qualify word knowledge using precise present tense verbs: use, know, understand, comprehend, recognize, don’t recognize.

• Report a group’s consensus on word knowledge using past tense citation verbs + that: agreed that, decided that, determined that, concluded that.

• Compare and contrast approaches using a complete sentence and precise adjectives: similar, comparable, identical, different.

• Negotiate with group members to construct a final collaborative response using appropriate present tense opinion statements: I think we should (say, put, use, write) __ because __; I still think __ is the strongest (choice, response, wording).

• Elicit and validate ideas while collaborating on a constructed response using appropriate questions and statements: What do you think makes sense? That makes sense. What’s your (opinion, suggestion)? That’s a great (idea, example, suggestion).

• Evaluate interview techniques using text evidence and precise phrases for elaboration: for example, for instance, as an example, to illustrate.
## Language for Academic Discussions

### 1. Stating Opinions
- I think ___ because ___.
- I (firmly, strongly) believe ___.
- In my opinion, ___.
- From my perspective, ___.
- I am convinced ___.
- My opinion on this (topic, issue) is ___.

### 3. Supporting / Elaborating
- For (example, instance), ___.
- A relevant example I (heard, read) was ___.
- One (possible, convincing) reason is ___.
- A (key, major) reason is ___.
- A relevant experience I had was ___.
- I experienced this when ___.

### 3. Providing Evidence
- After hearing ___, I am convinced ___.
- The data on ___ suggests ___.
- After reading ___, I conclude that ___.
- After reviewing ___, I assume that ___.
- Drawing from experience, I know that ___.
- Based on experience, it seems evident that ___.

### 4. Comparing / Contrasting
- My (idea, response) is similar to (Name’s).
- My (opinion, perspective) is similar to (Name’s).
- My response is similar to that of my classmates.
- My response is different from (Name’s).
- My (approach, perspective) is different from (Name’s).
- My (analysis, conclusion, solution) is different from (Name’s).

### 5. Agreeing / Disagreeing
- I (completely) agree with (Name) that ___.
- I share your perspective.
- My idea builds upon (Name’s).
- I don’t (quite, entirely) agree.
- I disagree (somewhat, completely).
- I have a different perspective on this (topic, issue).

## Language for Academic Collaboration

### 1. Eliciting
- What should we (say, put, write)?
- What do you think makes sense?
- What’s your (idea, opinion, experience)?
- Do you have anything to add?
- How would you (approach, complete) this task?

### 2. Contributing / Suggesting
- We could (say, put, write) ___.
- What if we (say, put, write) ___.
- I think ___ makes the most sense.
- I think ___ would work well.
- I think we should (add, include, consider) ___.

### 3. Validating
- That would work.
- That makes sense.
- That’s a great (idea, suggestion).
- I see what you’re saying.
- That’s worth considering.

### 4. Negotiating
- Let’s (say, put, use, write) ___ because ___.
- Let’s go with (Name’s) suggestion ___.
- I still think ___ is the strongest (choice, response).
- Let’s combine ideas and put ___.
- What if we (began, concluded) by ___.

### 5. Clarifying
- I don’t quite understand your (idea, reason).
- I have a question about ___.
- What exactly do you mean by ___?
- If I understand you correctly, you think that ___?
- Are you suggesting ___?

### 6. Restating
- So, you think that ___.
- So, your (idea, opinion, response) is ___.
- So, you’re suggesting that ___.
- Yes, that’s (right, correct).
- No, not exactly. What I (said, meant) was ___.

### 7. Reporting
- We (decided, concluded, determined) that ___ because ___.
- One (fact, reason, piece of evidence) we considered is ___.
- Our (point of view, response, conclusion) is that ___.
- After reviewing ___, we concluded that ___.
- We came up with a ___(similar, different) response.

### 8. Listening Attentively
- The (idea/example) I ___ (added/recorded) was ___.
- I (appreciated/related) to (Name’s) ___(example/experience).
- The most convincing reason I heard was ___.
- The strongest (argument/evidence) offered was ___.
- The contribution I (appreciated, added, selected) was ___.
### Phase 1: Brainstorm
1. Display and read aloud the discussion question
2. Students reread question aloud *(phrase-cued)*
3. Model brainstorming response(s) *(quick list, phrases, everyday English)*
4. Prompt students to think and record brief responses
5. Students check one or two preferred ideas to develop into academic responses

### Phase 2: Record
1. Introduce first frame *(visibly displayed, include model response)*
2. Students rehearse model response *(silently, phrase-cued)*
3. Direct attention to potentially unfamiliar vocabulary *(underline, write simple definition)*
4. Direct attention to and explain the grammatical target(s) *(underline, highlight)*
5. Model use of precise vs. everyday words using the Precise Word Bank *(if provided)*
6. Direct students to write an academic response using the first frame
7. Prompt students to consider *(example, reason, evidence)* to elaborate verbally
8. Students record response with first frame and consider how to elaborate
9. Repeat the process with any additional frame *(visibly displayed, include model response)*
10. Circulate to monitor, read sentences, and provide feedback

### Phase 3: Exchange
1. Direct students to silently reread their sentences in preparation to share
2. Cue partner *(A/B)* to read their response twice (then switch/A)
3. Circulate to provide feedback and preselect reporters
4. Cue partners to restate and record each other’s idea
5. Repeat phase 3 for response with second frame

### Phase 4: Report
1. Establish expectations for reporting using the 1st frame
2. Assign active listening task(s): take notes, identify similarities/differences
3. Record student contributions on board or organizer to display later
4. Cue preselected reporters
5. Elicit additional reporters using varied strategies *(e.g., name cards, popcorn, volunteers)*
6. Briefly synthesize contributions and make connections to article focus
7. Repeat phase 4 for response with second frame

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2016 ~ All rights reserved.
BRAINSTORM IDEAS
Write a quick list of types of bullying that occur at school. Consider verbal, physical, and cyber examples. Draw from experience or background knowledge.

• pantsing
• spreading rumors
• ____________________________________
• ____________________________________
• ____________________________________

PRECISE WORD BANK
verbally hurt (v): upset, tease, criticize, blame
physically hurt (v): hit, slam, yank, shove
sentence (n): remark, statement, insult, rumor
mean (adj): rude, offensive, disrespectful, harmful

EXCHANGE IDEAS
Use the frames to exchange ideas with your group. Support your opinion with a compelling example. Listen attentively and record ideas to complete the chart.

1. A fairly common form of _____ bullying I have _____ (verb + ed: observed, witnessed, learned about) at this school is _____ (verb + ing: shoving, excluding). For example, recently _____.

2. A widespread form of _____ bullying that _____ (verb + s: occurs, takes place) on campus is _____ (verb + ing: mocking). For instance, I am aware that _____.

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2016 ~ All rights reserved.
GIVE ONE • GET ONE: Earning Respect from Peers

PROMPT: What do you do to earn respect from your peers?

BRAINSTORM: List possible ways to earn respect from your peers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>At School</th>
<th>Outside of School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PRECISE WORD BANK

- nice (adj.)
  - honest, fair, considerate, patient, loyal, trustworthy, reliable
- doing (verb + ing)
  - encouraging, supporting, defending, listening, understanding

RECORD:

Rewrite ideas using the response frames and precise words. Prepare to elaborate verbally with a relevant example.

1. I try to earn respect from my peers by being _________________________________.
2. An important way I earn respect from my peers is by _________________________________.

EXCHANGE:

1. Initiate interactions with four classmates.
2. Share responses 2x and elaborate.
3. Listen attentively to their responses.
4. Record brief notes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Names</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language to Initiate Interactions:

* May I (share, exchange) ideas with you? * Of course. certainly. * Can you elaborate? * What’s your idea?

REPORT:

Use a past tense citation verb to report a classmate’s idea.

My classmate (Name) ________________________ that (he/she) earns respect by _____.

(indicated, pointed out, emphasized)
PROMPT: What do you do to earn respect from your peers?

LANGUAGE OBJECTIVE: Interacting in Meaningful Ways

Contribute ideas in a small group and unified-class discussion on a pre-writing topic using a complete sentence, accurate grammar, and precise word choices.

### Emerging
- I am always ____________ to my ____________.
  (adjective: kind, helpful, polite) (plural noun: friends, classmates, teammates)
- I earn respect from my peers by being ____________.
  (adjective: athletic, academic, artistic, musical, funny)
- I earn respect from my peers by ____________.
  (verb + ing: helping, listening, playing, showing, trying)

### Expanding
- I try to earn respect from my peers by ____________ being ____________.
  (adverb: always, never) (adjective: kind, unkind)
- One way I earn respect from my peers is by ____________ them when they are ____________.
  (verb + ing) (adjective)
- An important way I earn respect from my ____________ is by ____________ to be a successful ____________.
  (verb + ing: trying, attempting, working hard) (singular noun: athlete, scholar)

### Bridging
- An important way I attempt to earn respect from my peers by ____________ them when they are ____________.
  (adverb: consistently, reliably) (verb + ing) (adjective)
- A major way I ____________ to earn respect from my peers is by remaining ____________ even when they have ____________.
  (present tense verb) (adjective) (past participle: said, lied, hurt)
- To earn respect from my peers, especially my ____________
  I strive to be (a/an) ____________.
  (adjective: successful, positive, outstanding) (singular noun: athlete, scholar)
Student Progress Monitoring

Student progress monitoring is a practice that helps teachers use performance data to frequently evaluate the effectiveness of their lessons, either for individual students or for the entire class, and make informed decisions about content to reteach, grouping arrangements, and instructional time. A teacher commonly uses systematic progress monitoring with students who receive special education services or within early literacy programs. To implement student progress monitoring, the teacher identifies goals in a student’s IEP and/or the state grade level standards to establish reasonable goals in competencies such as math, reading or spelling that can be efficiently measured and tracked. The teacher determines a student’s current performance level on target skills and the rate of progress the student must make to meet achievement goals. Using brief, easily administered measures, the teacher frequently notes progress toward meeting goals and identifies students in need of additional or different forms of instruction.

ELD Lesson Monitoring

ELD lesson monitoring is a practice utilized by teachers within a designated or integrated English language development lesson to make informed and immediate adjustments in content, pacing, instructional delivery, and/or classroom management to enhance student learning and engagement.

Purposes of ELD Lesson Monitoring

The priorities within ELD coursework are to deepen students’ understandings of how English works and enhance their communicative competence through intentional instruction and meaningful, orchestrated language interactions with their teacher and peers. The major goal is dramatically increasing the quantity and quality of their verbal and written interactions using academic English. Frequently, within other coursework, teachers are preoccupied with identifying the strongest answers, admonishing and enlisting non-volunteers, and behavior management, which should never the chief purposes of monitoring within an ELD lesson.

Aims of ELD lesson monitoring, depending on the lesson stage and types of activities, include:

- Ensuring students are on task and successfully tackling assignment demands.
- Making the teacher accessible to students who have clarifying questions or needs.
- Gauging whether the pace of instructional delivery is or was appropriate.
- Circulating strategically to assess a representative range of student work or interactions.
- Identifying issues among individual, pair, and group progress.
- Taking opportunities for micro-teaching to individuals, pairs, or groups who have not grasped the linguistic, conceptual, or procedural demands of the assignment.
- Listening for English language production errors, when accuracy is a lesson objective.
- Reading written work and assessing the conceptual integrity and linguistic accuracy.
- Facilitating when learners are unable to sustain interaction(s) or comprehend each other.
- Redirecting idle or off-task behavior, and providing follow-up tasks for fast finishers.
- Coaching audible interactions between peers and during unified-class discussions.
- Identifying prospective contributors (with a range of responses, not simply the outstanding) for follow-up unified-class discussion.
- Noting who is contributing voluntarily and regularly during class discussions, and enlisting more reticent contributors in a supportive manner.
- Providing feedback that is timely, respectful, corrective, and focused on specific criteria.
- Providing prompts that elicit student reflection, language-focused self-correction, content enhancements and elaboration instead of mere teacher recasting.
- Making informed decisions in terms of what to do next, whether to modify the lesson and/or unit plan, and how to provide feedback to students on their performance.
**ESSENTIAL ROUTINES FOR ENGLISH LEARNERS**
**MULTIPLE CLASSROOM OBSERVATION TOOL**

*Directions:* Record a tally mark as you observe instruction that includes exemplars of Dr. Kinsella’s Essential Instructional Routines. Look for trends that indicate 1) effective implementation and 2) needs for additional training and/or coaching.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The teacher . . .</th>
<th>Rm #</th>
<th>Rm #</th>
<th>Rm #</th>
<th>Rm #</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Partner &amp; Group</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>arranges seating conducive to partnering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pairs students appropriately</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>has previously taught expectations for partnering (4Ls)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pre-assigns partner and group roles (A/B, 1-4, facilitator, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>has analyzed lesson for optimal partner/group tasks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>equips students with language tool(s) for academic interaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>visibly displays procedures for partnering and/or group tasks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cues partner 1/A, or group member #1 to initiate task</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setting Up</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>directs students’ attention (board, text, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>establishes lesson and language objectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sets purpose for lesson task(s)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>displays and explains task steps using clear, concise language</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>uses clear transition cues to outline steps in directions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstrates the skills required to complete the task</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provides written and verbal models of desired response/work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>checks for understanding of task expectations (pair-share, finger rubric, coded cards, written questions, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assigns active-listening tasks (point out similarities/differences, restate partner’s response, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assigns fast-finisher tasks (record 2nd sentence: elaborate w/ example; read section 2, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Monitoring</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ensures a clear route for unobtrusive monitoring from behind the learners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provides a clear process for and language to request assistance from teacher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>previews the room to confirm all students are off to a productive start</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>circulates strategically to assess a range of student work or interactions (2 mid-proficiency, 2 at-risk, 1 proficient, NOT every student)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>offers extra support for identified at-risk students or those experiencing difficulties</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>redirects off-task or idle students and assigns fast-finishers a follow-up task</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gauges pacing and need for more/less time rather than being wedded to a timer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>avoids interrupting with verbal reprimands, review of expectations, or praise</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reads written responses and provides concrete guidance for improvement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>listens to verbal responses and provides specific, actionable feedback</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provides metacognitive coaching/prompts to promote self-correction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coaches audible interactions (scholarly voice) and class reporting (public voice)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Observation Feedback Frames

The teachers facilitated productive partner or group interactions by . . .

- 
- 
- 

Instructional goal(s) for partner/group interactions include:

- 
- 
- 

The teachers successfully set up the lesson and tasks by . . .

- 
- 
- 

Instructional goal(s) for setting up include:

- 
- 
- 

The teachers structured competent verbal and written responses by . . .

- 
- 
- 

Instructional goal(s) for using response frames include:

- 
- 
- 

The teachers effectively monitored tasks, interactions and language use by . . .

- 
- 
- 

Instructional goal(s) for monitoring include:

- 
- 

**DR. KINSELLA’S ELD LESSON MONITORING ~ OBSERVATION TOOL**

**Directions:** As you observe an Integrated or Designated ELD lesson, mark 1 to indicate an observable step in lesson monitoring, or 2 to indicate an opportunity to provide additional coaching and support.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The teacher . . .</th>
<th>1 or 2 and Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ensures a clear route for unobtrusive monitoring from behind the learners</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provides a clear process for and language to request assistance from teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>previews the room to confirm all students are off to a productive start</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>circulates strategically to assess a range of student work or interactions (2 mid-proficiency, 2 at-risk, 1 proficient, NOT every student)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>offers extra support for identified at-risk students or those experiencing difficulties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>redirects off-task or idle students and assigns fast-finishers a follow-up task</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gauges pacing and need for more/less time rather than being wedded to a timer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>avoids interrupting with verbal reprimands, review of expectations, or praise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reads written responses and provides concrete guidance for improvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>listens to verbal responses and provides specific, actionable feedback</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provides metacognitive coaching/prompts to promote self-correction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coaches audible interactions (<em>scholarly voice</em>) and class reporting (<em>public voice</em>)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>facilitates when peers are unable to sustain interaction or comprehend each other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>preselects and informs 2-3 student(s) for initial reporting during class discussion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>uses varied strategies to elicit additional contributions during class discussion (partner nomination, random/name cards, all partner As, voluntary, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>offers brief, focused, positive reinforcement about the linguistic accuracy and thoughtfulness of contributions to class discussion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>refrains from vague/ineffectual praise comments (<em>Good job; Great; You’re smart</em>)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>refrains from digression and lengthy elaboration on students’ contributions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>structures accountable listening during class discussion with a purposeful task (<em>brief, focused note-taking, restating, comparing, elaborating, affirming, etc.</em>)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstrates awareness of what to clarify, re-teach, review, or practice further</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2016 ~ All rights reserved. Do not modify or distribute without advance written permission.
While students are engaged in completing a lesson assignment independently, in pairs or groups, the teacher …

∅ remains seated and idle (desk, stool, rocking chair)
∅ remains standing in front of room (podium, Smart Board)
∅ completes clerical tasks (taking roll, compiling paper, collecting late work, etc.)
∅ prepares lessons (Smart Board, laptop, pinning teaching ideas on Pinterest)
∅ does not make himself/herself available to students for assistance
∅ provides proximity in the form of hovering without observing or offering guidance
∅ speed walks around the classroom ostensibly providing proximity, without carefully reading work, listening to interactions, and providing useful feedback
∅ rubber stamps or adds stickers to individual or group work, largely for demonstrating time on task, rather than actually reading and listening, assessing strengths and weaknesses, or providing actionable feedback
∅ dwells on a target group of students (behavioral challenges, less proficient, boys) to monitor behavior without providing genuine assistance
∅ is preoccupied helping a student, pair, or group, loses track of pacing, and fails to recognize classmates are finished and idle
∅ interrupts student interactions and concentration on assignments with unified-class announcements, reminders, admonitions, or superficial praise
∅ fails to coach audible responses during collaborative or class discussions
∅ remains wedded to a timer (on Smart Board, Kahoot, etc.) for pacing and allocation of time for task completion, rather than conscientiously gauging the extent to which students understand the lesson content and task demands
∅ offers gratuitous and superficial praise (Good job, Excellent) without specifying what aspect of the work was particularly effective and the reason(s) why
∅ appropriates class discussion time and derails the flow of student contributions with excessive elaboration, jokes, conceptual bird-walks, personal interests and experiences (the Giants game outcome, fly-fishing trip, etc.) at the expense of enlisting more student participation and maintaining lesson cohesion
∅ fails to coach or challenge more thoughtful and linguistically accurate responses
∅ calls on students to contribute to class discussions as a disciplinary measure
∅ largely calls on non-volunteers, leaving reticent students anxious, and confident students frustrated and disengaged

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2016 ~ All rights reserved.
Providing Feedback on Oral Language Errors During ELD

Oral Language Error Types

- **Form Errors**: Errors made because of misunderstanding or lack of mastery of English grammar and syntax rules.
- **Vocabulary Errors**: Errors made because of voids in vocabulary knowledge and linguistic approximations, attempts to use a word or phrase acquired through listening ("on the other hand" = “onanuthahan”).
- **Pronunciation Errors**: Pronunciation difficulties often due to sounds that are not present in the student’s primary language.
- **Oral Reading Pronunciation Errors**: Pronunciation errors made while students read orally, due to misunderstanding of phonics rules or gaps in decoding skills.

Degrees of Error Severity

- **More Serious**: Systematic, appearing with regularity, or prevalent despite previous form-focused instruction and meaningful practice.
- **Less Serious**: Random and relatively isolated (caused by memory lapse, inattention, fatigue, or inadequate rule acquisition).

Less Effective Corrective Feedback Strategies

- **Complete Neglect**: Avoidance of any form of instructional intervention, whether implicit or explicit, due to a lack of concern, linguistic knowledge and pedagogical skills to remedy, preoccupation with content coverage, or concern about raising the student’s “affective filter”.

Pros: requires no time, effort or training whatsoever and maintains lesson pacing

Cons: allows students to practice their oral language errors into permanence, leading to development of “fossilized errors,” mistakes a student has made so many times over a span of time without form-focused feedback that the errors have become permanent features of the student’s natural speech and inordinately challenging if not impossible to correct.

- **Implicit Recasts**: The teacher does not preface correction by pointing out that the student has made an error; instead, the teacher subtly rearticulates or echoes what the student was trying to say with an utterance that includes corrections of one or more errors evident in the student’s utterance.

Pros: 1) Recasts merely require attentive listening on the teacher’s part and the ability to rephrase the student’s utterance correctly. 2) Recasts are less likely to interrupt the natural communication flow between the teacher and student or between students.
**Cons:** 1) Students more often than not fail to notice the correction and therefore do not benefit from it. During oral communication exchanges during a lesson, recasts are far less likely to produce “uptake,” that is, an utterance by the student indicating an attempt to do something with the teacher’s feedback. 2) Students infer that the teacher is offering validation by restating, not noticing distinctions in what the teacher uttered. 3) Students assume the teacher is merely repeating the statement more audibly for the unified class’s benefit. 4) Students perceive that the teacher is seeking clarification by restating, missing the attempt at providing corrective feedback. 5) Recasts are particularly ineffective in meaning-centered classrooms where students are accustomed to engaging in interactive tasks with a focus on fluency and task completion rather than the accuracy and thoughtfulness of their messages.

**More Effective Corrective Feedback Strategies**

- **Prompts:** Prompts explicitly draw a student’s attention to an error produced in a communicative exchange, either through elicitation or metalinguistic feedback, and encourage or require the student to attempt to repair the utterance.

  **Pros:** 1) Prompts overtly mark the need for the repair of an utterance and purposefully redirect students’ attention. 2) Prompts yield a higher rate of student uptake or repairs, both in immediate lesson tasks and future tests. 3) Prompts encourage students to focus on the thoughtfulness of their contributions as well as the accuracy of their English grammar, syntax, and vocabulary choices.

  **Cons:** 1) Explicit prompts may momentarily interrupt communication between the teacher and student or between students during a lesson exchange.

**Research on Oral Language Error Feedback in Second-Language Classrooms**


Verb Tense (incorrect verb tense)
I have a reading problem since I begin to study in the United States.

Verb Consistency (inappropriate shifts in verb tense)
I study with the television on sometimes when I was in high school because I am not interested in my homework.

Verb Form (verb incorrectly formed)
I have studying English for three years and I did not made a lot of progress.

Modal (incorrect use or formation of a modal)
I should had read the chapter twice to get a better understanding.

Sentence Structure (incorrect or awkward sentence structure)
There are more than me in this class have a problem with reading the textbook.

Subject-Verb Agreement (incorrect subject-verb agreement)
My brother bother me a lot when I am trying to do my homework reading.

Word Order (incorrect or awkward word order)
I don't understand what is the author talking about in this article.

Word Choice (wrong word choice, including prepositions)
My teacher discussed me about my paper in her office.
I feel very frustrated on my Biology class because I have trouble noting.

Word Forms (wrong word form)
My apartment is a distraction place to do my homework.
My sister can easy to read English books, but not me.
I have difficult to finish all my assignments on time.

Verb Complements (form of a verbal/verb complement is incorrect)
I enjoy to study English vocabulary.
I don't want discussing my paper with other students.

Article (incorrect or missing article)
I don't make a progress in my English reading.
I hope University will help me to improve my writing and reading ability.
I haven't decided on the college major.

Countable and Uncountable Nouns (a problem with the singular or plural form of a countable or uncountable noun in English)
I don't understand the feedbacks on my essay.
I did a lot of researches for this paper, and I don't know how to organize thems.
I skim all the page before I read the chapter to see what it is about.
Global Errors: A "global error" is a more serious error in a piece of writing. A global error interferes with the reader's ability to understand an entire sentence or paragraph within a piece of writing. A global error usually affects syntax and cohesion. A global error may also be a less serious yet high frequency error, such as an incorrect or missing article, which the writer makes throughout a large portion of the text.

Local Errors: A "local error" is a less serious error in a piece of writing. A local error is generally confined to a single clause and therefore affects only a small part of a sentence. While a local error may indeed be distracting and annoying, it usually does not impair the intelligibility of an entire sentence or paragraph. A local error will become a more serious global error if it appears frequently within a portion of the text.

Clause 1

Because I can't really concentrate my homeworks, I just only can study when I babysit.

The errors are these:
- Because is attached to the wrong clause.   Global
- An uncountable noun homework has been made plural.   Local
- The preposition is missing from the verb concentrate.   Local
- The word order of only can is awkward.   Local
- The expression just only is non-idiomatic.   Local

The errors in Clause 2 are local because they are confined to a single clause. But misplacing the subordinating conjunction because in Clause 1 is a global error, as it affects both clauses, and the meaning of the entire sentence. The conjunction because relates the two clauses; it should indicate the cause, not the result, in this relationship.

Consider the impact on the meaning of the sentence when all the local errors are corrected, leaving the global error because alone:

* Because I can't really concentrate on my homework, I can only study when I babysit.   Local errors corrected

Consider the impact on the meaning of the sentence when only the placement of the conjunction because is corrected, leaving the global errors alone:

* I can't really concentrate my homeworks because I just only can study when I babysit.   Global errors corrected

Any one correction may improve the sentence, but some do much more for the intelligibility than others. Correcting the global error, placement of the conjunction because, adds the most to the overall improvement of the sentence.
The following writing errors are generally more serious because they make it challenging for the reader to accurately understand the meaning of entire sentences or paragraphs. Fortunately, the rules governing the usage of these aspects of English grammar can be successfully integrated into a writing curriculum. English learners can learn these rules and apply them during guided, incremental proofreading opportunities.

**Verb Tense** (incorrect verb tense)
- I have a reading problem since I begin to study in the United States.

**Verb Consistency** (inappropriate shifts in verb tense)
- I study with the television on sometimes when I was in high school because I am not interested in my homework.

**Verb Form** (verb incorrectly formed)
- I have studying English for three years and I did not made a lot of progress.

**Modal** (incorrect use or formation of a modal)
- I should had read the chapter twice to get a better understanding.

**Sentence Structure** (incorrect or awkward sentence structure)
- There are more than me in this class have a problem with reading the textbook.

**Subject-Verb Agreement** (incorrect subject-verb agreement)
- My brother bother me a lot when I am trying to do my homework reading.

**Word Order** (incorrect or awkward word order)
- I don’t understand what is the author talking about in this article.

**Clause Formation** (incorrect usage of subordinating or coordinating conjunction)
- Even I try, but I don’t get a good grade.
- Because I don’t finish my Biology chapters, so it is difficult for me to understand those difficult science words.

**Fragment** (incomplete sentence)
- Besides the homework reading I have to finish.

**Run-On Sentences** (two independent clauses joined with a comma or no punctuation)
- My favorite place to read is my bedroom, it helps me relax and concentrate.

**Pronoun Reference /Agreement** (unclear pronoun reference or incorrect agreement)
- My tutor gave me some good suggestion about my writing, and I will use them.

**Unclear** (the meaning or message of a clause or sentence is unclear)
- To achieve this confident in myself I have came out to the world and be part of it
Common Local Errors

The following writing errors are generally less serious because they are usually confined to a single clause and do not dramatically alter the meaning of an entire sentence or paragraph. These errors can nonetheless be fairly annoying and distracting to many readers, particularly when they occur frequently throughout a text. Unfortunately, the guidelines for appropriate usage of these grammatical items are quite complex and take considerable time and effort to master.

English learners must have repeated exposure to correct usage of these aspects of grammar, both within and outside of the classroom, in order to begin to internalize the detailed rules. Control over these relatively complex aspects of English grammar generally comes later in second language acquisition. Teachers should therefore be more patient with errors and help developing writers establish manageable and incremental editing priorities, taking into consideration the frequency of the writer's errors as well as the student's current level of language proficiency.

Word Choice  (wrong word choice, including prepositions)
- I didn't know that we were supposed to put a biography at the end of our term paper.
- My teacher discussed me about my paper in her office.
- I feel very frustrated on my Biology class because I have trouble noting.

Word Forms  (wrong word form)
- My apartment is a distraction place to do my homework.
- My sister can easy to read English books, but not me.
- I have difficult to finish all my assignments on time.

Verb Complements  (form of a verbal/verb complement is incorrect)
- I enjoy to study English vocabulary.
- I don't want discussing my paper with other students.

Article  (incorrect or missing article)
- I don't make a progress in my English reading.
- I hope University will help me to improve my writing and reading ability.
- I haven't decided on the college major.

Countable and Uncountable Nouns  (error with the singular or plural form of a countable or uncountable noun in English)
- I don't understand the feedbacks on my essay.
- I did a lot of researches for this term paper, and I don't know how to organize them.
- I skim all the page before I read the chapter to see what it is about.

Nonidiomatic English  (not expressed this way in English)
- I am studying to my high point to get a good grade in this class.
- The thing I worry most is my essays.
## Error Marking Symbols

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symbol</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vt</td>
<td>incorrect verb tense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vf</td>
<td>verb incorrectly formed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>modal</td>
<td>incorrect use or formation of a modal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ss</td>
<td>incorrect sentence structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wo</td>
<td>incorrect or awkward word order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conn</td>
<td>incorrect or missing connecting word(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sv</td>
<td>incorrect subject-verb agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>art</td>
<td>incorrect or missing article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>s/pl</td>
<td>error with the singular or plural of a noun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wc</td>
<td>incorrect word choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wf</td>
<td>incorrect word form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prep</td>
<td>incorrect use of a preposition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frag</td>
<td>sentence fragment – incomplete sentence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rts</td>
<td>run-together sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pro ref</td>
<td>pronoun reference unclear or agreement incorrect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hom</td>
<td>Incorrect homophone (their/their/they’re; whose/who’s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sp</td>
<td>spelling error – word incorrectly spelled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cap</td>
<td>capitalization – capital letter needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lc</td>
<td>lower case – word(s) incorrectly capitalized</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>?</td>
<td>unclear – I don’t understand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🗑️</td>
<td>Omit this word. It doesn’t belong.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ℕ</td>
<td>Insert a word. Something is missing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🥽</td>
<td>Connect these two words, clauses, or sentences.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Original sentence**

*Study* hard is very important if you *wanted* to go to college.

**Error Correction Options:**

1. **Direct correction:**
   
   *Studying*  
   *want*  
   Study hard is very important if you wanted to go to college.

2. **Error location:**
   
   *Study* hard is very important if you *wanted* to go to college.

3. **Error code:**
   
   *wf*  
   *vt*  
   Study hard is very important if you *wanted* to go to college.

4. **Verbal cue:**
   
   *word form*  
   *tense*  
   Study hard is very important if you *wanted* to go to college.

5. **Marginal error direction:**
   
   *Study* hard is very important if you wanted to go to college.  ✔ *wf* ✔ *vt*

5. **End comment:**

   As you revise, be sure to check your verbs to see if they need to be in the past or present tense. I have underlined some examples of verb tense errors in the first part of your paragraph so that you can see what I mean.
The following errors are the top priorities to address:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paper #1</th>
<th>Paper #2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Red is my favorite color. It remind me of my hobbies. First, I love my car. I have a 1972 classic Volkswagon Bug. It is a convertible. My dad bought it for me. I work summer vacation and many weekend for his painting business. He never pay me a real salary. I rebuilt the engine, now it is in good shape. My Uncle Randy did the body work. Because he has a custom car body shop. He drive a Porsche. I painted my car fire engine red. That represent the car’s power, energy, speed. I love to get into my car on the weekend and go driving with the roof down. I feel free and happy. Out of school and out of the house. In addition, my car is one of my bestest friend because she listen to me. She never bother me and like the same music. Also, the color red remind me of my number one Bay Area football team, the Forty-Niners. Their uniform and logo are red and gold. During football season, I wear red on the weekend to show I am a big fan. Even if the Raiders are sorta playing better this year.

The color green has special meaning for me. First of all, it relate to my personal life. Green remind me of my home country. I am from Michoacan Province in Mexico, I grew up on my grandparents’ ranch. The color green make me think of the corn field surrounding our house. I miss the peaceful countryside and the courtyard of our home in Mexico, I now live in a noisy and crowded apartment building near Highway 101. In addition, the color green associate with my school life. In fact, green is a symbol of my most important high school involvement. I volunteer to be the secretary of the Rainforest Club, I am concern about the environment. In this club, we are making some fundraiser for a rainforest project. We plan to send money for planting new trees in Ecuador. In conclusion, green represent my homeland and my respect for nature.
**Student Error Awareness Worksheet**

**Purpose:** Enable students to discover sentence-level errors and prioritize them.

**Directions:** Mark a tally in the second column for each error marked on your returned paper. Then, record the total number of tally marks in the third column. Circle the most frequent errors and select two or three to begin working on first.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Error</th>
<th>Tally</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>incorrect verb tense</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>incorrect verb form</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>incorrect word order</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sub.-verb agreement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>article error</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>singular or plural noun error</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>incorrect word form</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>incorrect preposition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sentence fragment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>run-together sentences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>homophone error</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>spelling error</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following errors and corrections are the top priority to edit on my final draft:

1. ________________________________
2. ________________________________
3. ________________________________

I would appreciate some extra help with the following errors because I am still confused or having trouble:

1. ________________________________
2. ________________________________
3. ________________________________

© Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. 2016– All rights reserved. Do not modify or distribute electronically without permission.
Check and Edit

No! Not Evident

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Yes! Very Evident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Fix-up!</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Format**
0 1 2 3 4
1. Is the paper typed using 12-point and a suitable font?
0 1 2 3 4
2. Is the proper heading in the upper right-hand corner?
0 1 2 3 4
3. Is each paragraph indented?
0 1 2 3 4
4. Is the handwriting or typing neat and legible?
0 1 2 3 4
5. Are the margins appropriate (1.25”) on all sides?)
0 1 2 3 4
6. Are pages stapled in the upper left-hand corner?

**Mechanics**
0 1 2 3 4
1. Do all sentences begin with a capital letter?
0 1 2 3 4
2. Are proper nouns capitalized?
0 1 2 3 4
3. Do all sentences end in a period?
0 1 2 3 4
4. Are commas used to separate transitions and items in a list?
0 1 2 3 4
5. Are all words spelled correctly?

**Grammar & Usage**
0 1 2 3 4
1. Do pronouns agree with the nouns they are replacing?
0 1 2 3 4
2. Are conjunctions (e.g., when, although) used to connect sentences?
0 1 2 3 4
3. Are verbs written in the correct tense?
0 1 2 3 4
4. Do subjects and verbs agree?
0 1 2 3 4
5. Is the paper free of run-together sentences?
0 1 2 3 4
5. Are homophones used appropriately (e.g., there, their, they’re)?

**Proofreading and Editing Priorities**
1. 
2. 
3. 

© 2016 Kate Kinsella, Ed. D. ~ All rights reserved.
 Explicit, Interactive Grammar Lesson Sequence

1. **Inductive presentation**
   Model how to examine a sample paragraph or sentences that include both correct and incorrect versions of a particular grammatical point (e.g., run-together sentences, past tense verb ending) for students. Explicitly model the order to discover how and why (form and function) an error exists.

2. **Explicit examination and discussion of the rule or usage**
   Facilitate an explicit discussion of the grammatical rule and make reference to the prior inductive examination. This explicit presentation should include visible display (on the board or via PPT) and should include a handout upon which each student takes notes.

3. **Practice of form and function**
   Guide students to practice applying the new rule with a meaningful writing task, such as completing a cloze (selective deletion) passage or proofreading sentences that contain correct and incorrect forms. This practice exercise should include phases of gradual release: 1) teacher modeling, 2) partner tasks, 3) independently completion. Each phase should be carefully monitored and revised (if necessary).

4. **Incorporation of the grammar point into an independent writing assignment**
   Require students to use the new form in a brief (paragraph length) independent writing assignment. Ensure that the assignment topic elicits the target form (e.g., *The Qualities of My Best Friend* - to elicit the third person singular present tense -s marker). This exercise may be completed first independently, then reviewed and revised (if necessary) in a cooperative group or partner task.

5. **Proofreading**
   Guide students to practice proofreading (error detection and error correction) in a paragraph analysis task (ideally, on the same topic as the previous independent writing assignment). This task may be completed first independently, then reviewed and revised (if necessary) in a cooperative group or partner task.

6. **Independent proofreading of writing assignment final draft**
   Provide opportunities for students to proofread their own writing before handing in assignments. Act as a resource and guide. Students should not correct other students’ errors; otherwise, the teacher will not have a realistic assessment of an individual’s proficiency with the grammatical form.
Objective: As a result of this lesson, and ongoing guided practice, students will be able to discern the grammatical features in a variety of sentence fragments and become adept at revising sentence fragment errors.

- In English, a generic definition of a fragment is a piece of something broken off from a larger object, such as a fragment of glass from a shattered car windshield or a fragment of pottery from a broken ceramic vase.

- In English grammar, a sentence fragment is an incomplete sentence, which means that it is just a piece of an idea, not a whole idea. It cannot stand by itself.

  When writers use a group of words that
  (1) do not contain a subject or a verb or
  (2) do not make complete sense by themselves,
  the result is a sentence fragment, and therefore each is an error.

1. A fragment can be a dependent clause or phrase.

  Incorrect:
  *I am learning Power Point. Which will be useful in college classes.*
  *(Fragment)*

  Correct:
  *I am learning Power Point, which will be useful in college classes.*

  Incorrect:
  *Power point is a useful program to learn. Because it improves presentations.*
  *(Fragment)*

  Correct:
  *Power point is a useful program to learn because it improves presentations.*

2. A fragment can be missing a subject.

  Incorrect: *Is a useful program to learn because it improves presentations.*
  *(Fragment)*

  Correct:
  *Power point is a useful program to learn because it improves presentations.*

3. A fragment can be missing a verb.

  Incorrect: *Power Point one of the most popular presentation software programs.*
  *(Fragment)*

  Correct: *Power point is one of the most popular presentation software programs.*
Proofreading Tip:
Check carefully for sentences that begin with a conjunction. A sentence that begins with a conjunction, for example *but, since* or *which,* is usually a sentence fragment that needs to be joined to the previous sentence.

Conjunctions to watch out for: **and, but, so, after, before, as soon as, because, since, if, when, which, although, even though**

---

### Sample Grammar Workshop Reference Card

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Sentence Fragments</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Definition:</strong> A <strong>fragment</strong> is a piece of something broken off from a larger object, such as a fragment of glass from a shattered car windshield. A <strong>sentence fragment</strong> is an incomplete sentence, which means that it is a just a piece of an idea, not a whole idea. It cannot stand by itself.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Examples:** *I am learning Power Point. Which will be useful in college classes.*  
(Fragment)  
*Is a useful program to learn. Because it improves presentations.*  
(Fragment)  
(Fragment)  
(Fragment) |
| **How to fix sentence fragments:**  
- **Add a subject or verb.**  
*Power Point is a useful program to learn.*  
- **Join the independent clause and the dependent clause.**  
*I am learning Power Point, which will be useful in college classes.*  
*Power point is a useful program to learn because it improves presentations.* |
| **Reminder:** Conjunctions often start a sentence fragment: **and, but, so, after, before, as soon as, because, since, if, when, which, although, even though** }
Ten-Minute Constructed Response: Instructional Routine

A ten-minute response provides a written opportunity to practice elaborating on a significant detail or developing a point. It begins with a clearly stated claim, followed by one or two supporting sentences that elaborate with a relevant example, convincing reason, or personal experience.

Ten-Minute Response Instructional Routine Steps

Phase I: Teacher-led (I’ll do it)

1. Distribute a Ten-Minute Constructed Response notetaking page.
2. Guide students in reading the (I do) model response using the echo or cloze fluency routine.
3. Analyze the response features: claim, supporting details, transitions, precise words.
4. Establish language targets for the response: e.g., precise words, subject-verb agreement.
5. Highlight the correct language targets in the model paragraph.

Phase II: Teacher and Students (We’ll do it)

1. Guide students in reading the (We do) frame using the echo or cloze fluency routine.
2. Pair students to brainstorm precise words and phrases to complete the blanks.
3. Record suggested words and phrases on the board.
4. Select appropriate content to complete the blanks: class vote, teacher’s choice, etc.

Phase III: Partners (You two will do it)

1. Pair students to collaborate on writing the (You’ll do) response.
2. Provide the initial sentence, using the sentence frame and an idea from the discussion.
3. Direct students to put down their pens and discuss their support for the claim.
4. Elicit strong contributions from a few students.
5. Direct partners to mutually decide upon their supporting sentence(s) before writing.
6. Pre-select 2-3 pairs to present their response (using a document camera, etc.).

Phase IV: Independent (You’ll do it)

1. Assign the independent (You do) response.
2. Guide students in proofreading and editing considering the assigned language targets.
3. Pair students to read their responses and provide feedback on idea development.
4. Wrap up with response presentations, one pre-selected and one volunteer.
Prompt: Are animals capable of experiencing human emotions? Write a ten-minute response expressing your opinion. Begin with a detail sentence, followed by two supporting sentences, drawing evidence from experience or sources.

✎ I’ll do it… Teacher

I firmly believe that animals are capable of experiencing the common human emotion, jealousy. As an example, when my two-year-old nephew recently climbed on the sofa to snuggle and read with me, my bulldog puppy Polo jumped up and wiggled his way between us, then placed his head on my lap to show he was more important than the child. This surprising behavior clearly demonstrated that he felt jealous of my nephew.

✎ We’ll do it… Teacher and Students

In my opinion, animals are capable of experiencing the common human emotion, joy. For example, when our family’s pet (noun) know she is going to (base verb) , she always responds by (verb + ing) and (verb + ing). This predictable behavior illustrates that our (noun) experiences genuine .

✎ You’ll do it… With a Partner

From my perspective, animals are capable of experiencing the common human emotion, love. For instance, when This affectionate behavior surely proves that .
Prompt: How do good citizens behave at school? Describe your classmates’ actions that show they are trying to be good citizens.

I’ll do it... Teacher

I saw my student Brian being helpful. He showed his partner Alex how to use the three-hole punch.

We’ll do it... Teacher and Students

I saw my classmate _______________ being _____________ (adjective).
_____________ (She/He) waited to share ___________________________ (noun) with ___________ (her/his) group after the others had __________________________ (verb).

We’ll do it... Teacher and Students

I saw my classmate _______________ being _____________ (adjective).
_____________ (She/He) worked well with ___________ (her/his) group during science to make a new _______________________ (noun) for our class’ pet _____________ (noun).

You’ll do it... Partners

We saw our classmate _______________ being _____________ (adjective).
_____________ (She/He) got a box of tissues for a student who was feeling sick and ___________________________ (verb-ing) during our math __________________________ (noun).
Dictionaries

Supplemental Informational Text Selections
Gable, L. *What’s happening in the USA/World/California?* (fax: 831-426-6532) www.whpubs.com
*newsela: Nonfictional Literacy and Current Events* https://newsela.com
*The New York Times Upfront Magazine*. Scholastic, Inc. (grades 9-12)
*National Geographic Magazine for Kids*. (grades 2-5)
*Time Magazine for Kids*. (grades 2-5)
*Scholastic News*. (grades 3-5) *Scholastic Action*. (grades 6-8) *Scholastic Scope*. (grades 6-8)

Curriculum to Accelerate Academic Language Knowledge and Skills
Dr. Kinsella’s Supplemental Program for Teaching High-Utility Academic Words:

*The Academic Vocabulary Toolkit* (2012). Cengage-National Geographic Learning. (Grades 7-12)

Dr. Kinsella’s 4-12 ELD Program for Accelerating Academic English Proficiency and Writing:

*English 3D: Describe, Discuss, Debate* (2016). Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. (Grades 4-12)
*English 3D: Course A 1 & 2* (2016). (Elementary) Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. (Grades 4-6)
*English 3D: Course B 1 & 2* (2016). (Middle School) Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. (Grades 6-8)
*English 3D: Course C* (2013). (High School) Houghton Mifflin Harcourt. (Grades 9-12)

Related Professional Articles and Research Briefs by Dr. Kinsella