Identifying Potential Minor Victims of Human Trafficking: A Local Crisis

Corey J. Rood, MD
Child Abuse & Neglect Services - Children’s Hospital
Assistant Professor, University of Utah School of Medicine
Utah Trafficking Task Force UTIP/UTIP Executive Committee
UTIP Medical Subcommittee Co-Chair

Disclosures/Conflicts of Interest & Disclaimer

• No financial relationships to disclose or Conflicts of Interest (COIs) to resolve.

• This presentation will be a call to action.

Objectives

• To review the common vulnerabilities of DMST victims and common venues for recruitment and trafficking

• To identify ways in which MDT members can increase identification of minor trafficking victims in their settings

• To discuss what to do when a victim is identified or reasonable suspicion arises – community MDT response

• To review the value of Trauma-informed care in response
Clinical Vignettes

Stand if you think this is trafficking.
Stay seated if you think it is something other than trafficking.

• Young 15 yo Female
  – ED for Acute Sexual Assault
  – Pregnancy+, HIV+
  – Forensic Interview at CJC discloses:
    * men pay money to have sex with her, money is collected by her 18 yo sister

Vignettes Cont...

17 yo Male – “runaway” from Foster Home
• On the street (homeless)
• Occasionally will trade sex for couch surfing or for a bite to eat from friends or others
Vignettes Cont...

- 16 yo Female – lives at home with family
  - Posts own online personal ads for sexual favors
  - Provides sexual favors or sex pics/vids for money
  - Honor roll at school, stable family home

Vignettes Cont...

- 15 yo Male – unaccompanied, undocumented minor from Honduras
  - Works in roofing/construction
  - Threatened with a knife by 4 Mexican Cartel members to sell drugs on the street for them
  - Cartel keeps daily/weekly tabs
  - Begins selling and does so for 4 months before informed on by a CI and arrested
  - Charged with possession and distribution

Vignettes Cont...

- 17 yo female – homeless runaway from welfare system
  - Approached on street about job on pot farm in Colorado
  - Promised free pot, easy good money, and able to leave whenever
  - 3 months later returns without money (not paid), but was allowed to smoke free pot
  - No coercion or force
Federal Anti-Trafficking Laws

- The Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000.
- U.S. Federal law: “severe forms of trafficking in persons” includes:
  - *Sex Trafficking:* human trafficking induced by force, fraud, or coercion to do a commercial sex act.
  - *Labor Trafficking:* human trafficking induced by force, fraud, or coercion for the purposes of subjecting to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.

*Proof of force, fraud, coercion is not required for victims <18 years.

Sex Trafficking:
8 Typologies in the U.S.

[Images of 8 typologies: Residential, Outdoor Solicitation, Escort Services, Pornography, Bars, Strip Clubs, & Condos, Personal Sexual Servitude, Sex Addiction, Hair Care, Beauty & Legging, Restaurants & Food Service, Electronic Work, Peddling & Begging, Landscaping, Health & Dentistry, Construction.]

Labor Trafficking:
17 Typologies in the U.S.


Polarisproject.org/typology
U.S. Human Trafficking Data

8,759 cases (10,615 victims; 4,863 traffickers) Confirmed U.S. trafficking cases reported in 2017 to National Human Trafficking Hotline (NHTH)

83% Sex Trafficking
   • 40% children; 90% female; 45% US citizens

23% Labor Trafficking
   • 16% children; 57% female; 68% foreign nationals or legalized immigrants (38 different countries)

Polarisproject.org

TRAFFICKING IN U.S.

All trafficking cases reported to the National Human Trafficking Hotline (NHTH) and BeFree Textline in 2017.
*Cases may include multiple victims

Polarisproject.org/typology

AGE AT TIME SEX OR LABOR TRAFFICKING BEGAN

Polaris Project 2017
Sex Trafficking Average Age of Entry

Controversial statistics

- 12-14 yrs (Estes & Weiner 2001)
  - Surveyed DMST victims only
- 16 yrs (Carpenter & Gates, 2016)
  - San Diego gang involvement
- 18 yrs (Polaris Project 2016)
  - Although 44% were ≤17 yrs

Top Personal Risk Factors for HT

- Poverty
- Homelessness
- Substance use
- Sexual abuse/assault
- Child abuse/neglect
- Runaway/throwaway
- Juvenile Justice System or Foster Care involvement
- LGBTQ
- Domestic violence
- Mental health problems or concerns
- Displaced persons (refugees, immigrants, etc.)

Before Being Trafficked

History of Trauma: physical and/or sexual abuse, emotional abuse, neglect, abandonment, divorce, IPV, substance abuse by caregivers, etc.

Goldberg et al., 2016

- 90% had prior exposure to a form of child maltreatment
  - 60% witnessed parental illicit substance abuse
  - 57% victims of child sexual abuse
  - 30% exposure to DV
  - 30% victims of child physical abuse

Ohio Human Trafficking Commission, 2012

- 47% were raped more than a year prior to entering trafficking
- 44% victims of child physical abuse
- 40% victims of child sexual abuse
Screening Tools for Human Trafficking

- VERA Institute
- Urban Institute
- US DHHS – Administration for Child & Families
- Mass Medical Society
- Polaris Project
- WAR on Slavery
- Dignity Health
- Greenbaum et al. – pediatrics/medical

Risky Behaviors Teen Questionnaire

- Screening tool used in Safe & Healthy Families clinic
- All children ages 12 and older
- 18 questions with follow up questions for answers of “yes” or “don’t know”
- Screens for
  - Risky behaviors
  - Sex trafficking
  - Teen dating violence
  - Labor trafficking

Risky Behaviors Questions

1. Some teens have a hard time living at home and feel that they need to run away. Did you ever run away from home?
2. Some teens are “kicked out” of their home or the place they were staying. Did you ever get kicked out of your home or the place you were staying?
3. Some teens use drugs or drink alcohol. Did you use drugs or alcohol in the last year?
4. Some teens have been involved with the police for running away, for breaking curfew, for shoplifting, or something else. There can be lots of different reasons. Did you ever have problems with the police?
Risky Behaviors Questions

1. Some teens have a hard time living at home and feel that they need to run away. Did you ever run away from home?
2. Some teens are “kicked out” of their home or the place they were staying. Did you ever get kicked out of your home or the place you were staying?
3. Some teens use drugs or drink alcohol. Did you use drugs or alcohol in the last year?

465,676 FBI entries for missing children in 2016 in U.S.

1 in 30 youth ages 13-17 experienced a form of homelessness over a 12-month period. That’s about 700,000 youth. About three-quarters of them involved explicitly reported homelessness (including running away or being kicked out) and one-quarter involved couch surfing only.

– Between February 2014 and June 2016
– Interviewed 641 homeless and runaway youth ages 17-25 yrs (total 641)
– 30% of youth were sex trafficking survivors
– 8% of youth were labor trafficking survivors
– 7% of youth admitted forced to work in drug trade
– 19% engaged in Survival Sex

68% of the youth who had either been trafficked or engaged in survival sex or commercial sex had done so while homeless.

LGBTQ youth accounted for 36% of the sex trafficking victims
• YES Study 2016 – Phoenix, AZ (homeless youth)
  – Ages 18-25 (total 207)
  – 57% drug/alcohol use (21% addicted drugs; 12% addicted alcohol)
  – 33% report victim of sex trafficking experience

2016 Youth Experiences Survey
• 38.6% of the females – sex trafficked
• 25.4% of the males – sex trafficked
• Of the 13 individuals who identified as other gender (transgender, gender queer, two-spirit, nonconforming), 61.5% reported sex trafficked
• Age of first sex trafficking victimization reported ranged from 11 to 24 years (M = 17.9, SD = 2.95).
2016 Youth Experiences Survey

Comparing sex trafficked homeless youth with non-sex trafficked homeless youth, sex trafficked group was more likely to be:
- LGBTQ
- Addicted to drugs and/or alcohol
- Self-harm cutting/suicide attempt
- Mental health problem/diagnosis
- Bullied by school peers
- History of teen dating violence
  - Child physical abuse
  - Child sexual abuse
  - Child emotional abuse

ACES

- Aces are incredibly common
  - 67% of population had at least 1 ACE
  - 12.6% (1 in 8) had four or more ACEs
- In the Homeless Youth Risk and Resilience Study (HYRRS) the mean Adverse Childhood Events score = 4.6
- For youth who experienced trafficking the mean Adverse Childhood Events score = 6

Risky Behaviors Questions

4. Some teens have been involved with the police for running away, for breaking curfew, for shoplifting, or something else. There can be lots of different reasons. Did you ever have problems with the police?
Trafficked Youth & JJS

- Trafficked youth arrested for various reasons:
  1. Identified as juvenile offenders of sex crime
  2. Manipulated by traffickers to participate in other criminal enterprise (theft, smuggling, assault,...)
  3. Picked up on drug/alcohol charges during time being trafficked

Youth & Juvenile Justice

- ASU 2015 – Juvenile Probation Incidence of Sex Trafficking
  - 5.4% of adjudicated youth report sex trafficking victimization
    - 65% addicted to drugs or alcohol
    - 62% had prior JJS involvement

- 2016 Florida Human Trafficking Report
  - Human Trafficking Hotline 2009-2015 (3,524 minor victims)
    - 56.7% prior involvement with JJS
      - 5.6% had been arrested at least once for “child prostitution”

Juvenile Justice Survey Data for Utah Detention Centers 2015-2017 (n=1,945)
Safe Harbor Law

- Address inconsistencies with how exploited children are treated.
- Provide protective provisions for juvenile victims of sex trafficking (no longer considered “child prostitutes”) 
- By 2015, **34 States** had adopted Safe Harbor legislation
  - Vary widely in scope
  - Create immunity from prosecution (some)
  - Create a diversion program (some)

[Human Trafficking Issue Brief: Safe Harbor, Polaris Project, 2015]

Utah Safe Harbor Law

- Passed in 2015
  - Requires DCFS to provide services to child engaged in prostitution or sexual solicitation
  - Any child engaged in prostitution or sexual solicitation may not be subject to delinquency proceedings
  - Amends abuse definition to include human trafficking of a child for sexual exploitation

[Human Trafficking Issue Brief: Safe Harbor, Polaris Project, 2015]

Teen Dating Violence Questions

5. Did a boyfriend or girlfriend in a dating or serious relationship ever pressure you, or make you feel pressured, to do something you did not want to do?
6. Did a boyfriend or girlfriend in a dating or serious relationship ever physically hurt you or threaten to hurt you (hit, pushed, kicked, choked, burned, or something else)?
7. Did a boyfriend or girlfriend in a dating or serious relationship ever make you feel afraid, humiliate you, or emotionally abuse you in any way?
8. Did a boyfriend or girlfriend in a dating or serious relationship, or anyone else, ever rape you or force you to participate in any kind of sexual activity that you did not want?
Human Trafficking

Methods of Conditioning

- Starvation
- Isolation
- Beatings/Torture
- Rape and gang rape
- Threats of violence to victim’s family/friends
- Forced drug abuse
- Cultural/spiritual manipulation

Methods of Control

- Kept under guard or electronic surveillance
- Use of restraints
- Strict control of medical care or medications
- Pregnancy – control children
- Control documents, ID, money, food, etc.
- Humiliating photos/videos - blackmail
Trauma Bonding/Stockholm Syndrome

- “Captivity, which brings the victim into prolonged contact with the perpetrator, creates a special type of relationship, one of coercive control.”
- “The goal of the perpetrator is to instill in his victim not only fear of death, but also gratitude for being allowed to live.”

(Dr. Judith Herman, Trauma and Recovery, 1992)

Sex Trafficking Questions

9. Did someone ever ask or force you to undress or strip in public, such as at a party, bar, or strip club?
10. Did someone ever ask or force you to pose nude (expose a private part) for a photo or video that they either took of you or forced you to take of yourself?
11. Did a boyfriend or girlfriend in a serious or dating relationship, or anyone else, ever rape you or force you to participate in any kind of sexual activity that you did not want?
12. Did a boyfriend, girlfriend, or anyone else ever ask you, or force you, to have sex of any type with ANOTHER person?
13. Some teens are in a position where they really need money, drugs, food, or a place to stay, or something else. Did you ever trade sex of any type for money, drugs, clothing, a place to stay, a cell phone, or something else you needed or wanted?
Primary Venues of CSEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Venue Type</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel/Motel-Based</td>
<td>35.06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Street-Based</td>
<td>16.16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential brothel</td>
<td>11.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escort service/delivery service</td>
<td>10.03%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other venues</td>
<td>8.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pornography</td>
<td>5.48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostess/strip club-based</td>
<td>3.94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Truck stop-based</td>
<td>3.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal sexual services</td>
<td>3.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial escort</td>
<td>2.78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bar/club-based</td>
<td>1.44%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Online Classifieds: 2,023 (Polaris Project 2012)

What is Sextortion?

Sexual exploitation in which threatened release of sexual images, videos, or information is the means of coercion.

Master of Seduction vs. Torture Tactics

**Guerilla**
- Violent
- Use abuse and intimidation to recruit and keep victims in their “stable” in line
- "Break" a victim’s will
- Physical and sexual abuse
- Isolation
- Coercion
- Threats
- Substance Abuse

**Finesse**
- Discreet Fashion
- Pose as boyfriend
- Very perceptive when choosing victims
  - Seek out those with tough home lives or low self-esteem
- Tell he/she is beautiful and buy gifts
- Love and affection, form a sexual relationship
13. Some teens are in a position where they really need money, drugs, food, or a place to stay, or something else. Did you ever trade sex of any type for money, drugs, clothing, a place to stay, a cell phone, or something else you needed or wanted?

Survival Sex

- 1999 Greene et al.
  - Street & Shelter youth 12-21 yrs (total 1159)
  - Street = 27.5% sex trafficked
  - Shelter = 9.5% sex trafficked

- 2010 Chettiar et al.
  - Street youth 14-26 yrs (total 560)
  - 11.3% engaged in survival sex in past 6 months
  - Variables associated with survival sex:
    - Female
    - Native ethnicity
    - Drug use (crack/meth)

Labor Trafficking Questions

14. Did someone where you work (or have worked) ever physically hurt you (hit, kick, choke, punch, or something else)?
15. Did someone where you work (or have worked) ever threaten you, make you feel scared or unsafe, or make you feel you couldn’t leave?
16. Did you ever work at a job and someone else received your payments instead of you?
17. Did you ever work without getting paid, or without getting the payment you were promised?
Involuntary Servitude

• Any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that, if the person did not enter into or continue in such condition, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint.

Peonage

• Involuntary servitude + a fourth specific fact:
  – That the involuntary servitude was compelled by the person in order to satisfy a real or imagined debt.
Debt Bondage

- The status or condition of a debtor arising from a pledge by the debtor of his or her personal services or of those of a person under his or her control as a security for debt, if the value of those services as reasonably assessed is not applied toward the liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined.

Slavery

- The condition of a person whom any or all the powers attaching to the right of ownership are exercised.

The Path to Exploitation

**Pull Factors**
- Circumstances that pull individuals toward a situation.
  - The hope for better opportunities, escape of oppression, and high demand.

**Push Factors**
- Conditions that push persons away from a situation.
  - Poverty, natural disaster, corruption and violence, economic instability, lack of rights, and civil conflict.

(Polaris Project, 2009)
Vulnerability Factors: Labor

- High unemployment
- Poverty
- Crime
- Discrimination
- Corruption
- Political Conflict
- Cultural Acceptance of Practice

Method of Recruitment

- Kidnapping
- Unaccompanied Minor (illegal; refugee; legal immigrant)
- Deception/Fraud
  - Newspaper ads promising career opportunities in foreign countries
  - Recruitment by other victims
  - Falsified travel document
  - Visa overstays

US Locations and Occupations Known to be Vulnerable to Labor Trafficking

- Housecleaning services
- Landscape and gardening businesses
- Domestic (home/childcare) workers
- Large-scale agricultural labor
- Construction sites
- Casinos
- Garment factories
- Hotels (housekeeping)
- Nail & Hair salons
- Migrant or transitional communities
- Magazine subscription and other door to door sales
- Peddling Rings
- Begging Rings

Anthony Talbott, University of Dayton/Abolition Ohio
Homeless Youth – Labor Trafficked

91% of youth reported being offered lucrative work opportunities that turned out to be fraudulent, scams, or sex trafficking.

8% were Labor Trafficked

7% of the 8% were involved in drug trade as the form of Labor Trafficking

Who Are The Traffickers?

• Organized crime

• Neighbors, friends, family members, village chiefs

• Agricultural operations

• Business owners

• Families

WHERE AND HOW VICTIMS PRESENT
Identifying Victims of Human Trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatment Search</th>
<th>% Reporting (N=98)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any contact with Jonette</td>
<td>87.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any type of clinic</td>
<td>27.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital ER</td>
<td>62.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planned Parenthood</td>
<td>29.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular doctor</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urgent care clinic</td>
<td>21.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Health Clinic</td>
<td>19.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighborhood clinic</td>
<td>19.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinic office</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other doctor</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

87.8% had contact with a healthcare provider while they were being trafficked, 65% went alone to get birth control

Provider Types that Victims of HT Visited

Potential Signs of DMST

- No ID or isn’t carrying own ID
- Living with employer or “friends”
- Cannot remember address
- Inconsistencies in story
  - True of most trauma victims
- Accompanying adult does not let pt speak for him/herself, is not who they say they are (parent, uncle/aunt, etc.)
- Hypervigilance/paranoia
- General poor health/malnourishment
- Significant cash, hotel room keys, or condoms on person
- Accompanying adult won’t let pt be alone
Potential Signs cont.

- Stated age older than visual appearance
- Multiple arrests for "prostitution"
- Multiple STIs, sexual partners
- Evidence of sexual trauma
- Tattoos/branding/cutting/burning
- Runaway/throwaway youth
- Homeless youth
- School truancy/multiple absences

(Plakota Project)

WHAT IF YOU IDENTIFY A VICTIM?

“You may choose to look the other way, but you can never say again that you did not know.”
- William Wilberforce

Communicating with Victims of Human Trafficking

- Talk with patient alone
  - Accompanying caregiver/companion may be trafficker
  - Standardize speaking to all pre-/adolescents alone
    - Screen for HT, dating violence, suicidality, sexual history, etc.
- Enlist trusted interpreter
  - NOT family member or from same community
  - May require phone interpreting service
  - Important to limit history gathering to our specific role
Who to Involve?

• Concerns for potential trafficking or physical or sexual abuse/assault:
  – Call DCFS 1-855-323-3237 and Law Enforcement 9-1-1
  – Call Safe & Healthy Families (SHF): 801-662-3600 or local Children’s Justice Center (CJC) for guidance
  – National Human Trafficking Hotline: 1-888-373-888
  – UTIP Hotline: 1-801-200-3443

Role of the Children’s Justice Centers

• Forensic interview, medical examination & treatment
• Partner with Safe & Healthy Families and local Human Trafficking response networks
  – Human Trafficking Victim Services Programs
  – Utah Trafficking in Persons (UTIP) Task Force
  – Referrals to counseling and mental health services

• Risky Behaviors Teen Questionnaire – implemented by medical
• Training and education
• Referral to Mental Health services

Trauma-Informed Care

• Trauma-informed care approach includes an understanding of trauma and an awareness of the impact trauma has on mental health, coping ability, physical health, relationships, and success in the workplace and community
• It emphasizes a cultural shift in health care from asking, "What is wrong with you?" to asking, "What has happened to you?"

(SAMHSA TIP Series 17, 2014; Harris 2001)
### Anti-Human Trafficking Programs & Resources

- Polaris Project and National Human Trafficking Hotline (NHTH)
- International Labour Organization
- FBI's Innocence Lost Initiative
- Nation Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC)
- The Urban Institute
- End Child Prostitution and Trafficking (ECPAT) USA
- UN Women's Institute for the Advancement of Women (UNIFEM USA
- International Justice Mission
- Shared Hope International
- Free the Slaves
- Salvation Army
- Women at Risk International
- Dallas Police Department’s High Risk Victim and Trafficking (HRVT) model
- Children of the Night, Los Angeles
- Runaway Girl, FPC training
- Truckers Against Trafficking
- Airline Ambassadors
- GEMS: Girls Education & Mentoring Services; NYC
- Nickels, Christine Stark
- Many, many more…
Additional Resources

• Books
  - The Slaves Next Door: Human Trafficking and Slavery in America Today – Bales and Soodfar, 2009
  - Not for Sale: The Return of the Global Slave Trade – Batstone, 2010
  - Not in My Town: Exposing and Ending Human Trafficking and Modern-Day Slavery – Borroughs and Powell, 2011
  - The Berlin Tumperke: A True Story of Human Trafficking in America – Beckhard, Barton and Moretti, 2011
  - Somebody’s Daughter: The Hidden Story of America’s Prostituted Children and the Battle to Save Them – Sher, 2013

References

• Federal TIP List: http://www.state.gov/j/ntr/organisations/27362.pdf
  - 2014 million enslaved worldwide – statistics reference

• Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC) Definition


• Criminal Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC) Definition

• Federal Labor Trafficking Definition

• Federal Labor Trafficking Definition

• Federal Labor Trafficking Definition

References cont.


• The Nature and Extent of Drug Trafficking in San Diego County: Executive Summary: University of San Diego School of Law, 2012.


• National Human Trafficking Resource Center: http://www.nationalhumantrafficking.org

• The Urban Institute: http://www.urban.org


• The Nature and Extent of Drug Trafficking in San Diego County: Executive Summary: University of San Diego School of Law, 2012.


• National Human Trafficking Resource Center: http://www.nationalhumantrafficking.org

• The Urban Institute: http://www.urban.org


• The Nature and Extent of Drug Trafficking in San Diego County: Executive Summary: University of San Diego School of Law, 2012.

References cont.


Human Trafficking Recognition & Prevention begin with you...